



RESEARCH PAPER

Electoral Trends and Political Dynamics of Punjab Province

Yawar Hayat Shah*¹ Gulshan Majeed²

1. PhD Scholar Political Science, Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

DOI

[http://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2022\(6-II\)14](http://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2022(6-II)14)

PAPER INFO

Received:

February 12, 2022

Accepted:

April 05, 2022

Online:

April 14, 2022

Keywords:

Biradari,
Electoral Trends,
Local Politics,
Punjab,
Voting Behavior

***Corresponding**

Author

yawarhayatshah@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

The electoral process is an integral part of a democratic system. It is the legitimate and constitutional way of coming into power and governing the state. Consistency in the process of elections and a transparent electoral process strengthens the overall political development in the state. The electoral system of Pakistan encompasses multiple factors including identity, party affiliation, local grouping, and provincial-based issues. Punjab has a vital role in the overall political dynamics of Pakistan. In this context, this paper entails a quantitative and qualitative study of the main electoral trends of Punjab. It is being observed that political party-based association, local groupings, factors of caste, biradari, ideology, and religious identities are the main contributing factors in defining the voting behavior and constituency trend in Punjab.

Introduction

Punjab being the largest province in terms of population has a predominant position on the political chessboard of Pakistan. In terms of parliamentary numbers, Punjab has 148 seats in the national assembly of Pakistan. In addition, under the women quota, Punjab has 35 seats (www.na.gov.pk, n.d.). For decades the electoral demography of Punjab is symbolic that the one who rules Punjab dominates in the center as well. Elections trends across Pakistan vary in terms of voting behavior and the culture of participation in politics. Voting behavior and electoral choices are a combination of psychological, sociological, socio-economic, and political realities of the area. Political mobilization and electoral campaigns predetermine the participatory culture of the society. Therefore, electoral trends have a profound impact on the overall democratic culture of the state. Electoral contestations in Punjab are mainly derived from multifaceted factors including party affiliations, local groupings, caste, sectarian division, family ties, and personality-specific support.

Literature Review

In this context, Hassan Javid has given a comprehensive historical description of the political elite in Punjab and their role in electoral politics. The ruling land-owned elite in rural Punjab remained dominant on the political structure of Punjab in the pre-Partition as well as in the post-partition phase. Though the colonial

dependence on local land-owning elites were different as compared to Mughal and Sikh era due to their modern bureaucratic and governance transformation in the sub-continent but eventually they relied on land-holders and appointed them as revenue collectors which reflect the relationship between local influencers and the British in the sub-continent. The economic and social status of the landed elite in Punjab always has a powerful position in the local, provincial, and the general elections. Most of the candidates who have a proportionate level of land holdings and local influence dominate the electoral politics. This trend of influencer land-holders and their dominant role in politics continued in Punjab even after the independence of Pakistan. For instance, when Ayub Khan enacted the system of Basic democracies and banned the political parties, it was the landed class that contributed to providing legitimacy to the authoritarian regime. This trend remained vital in the electoral politics of Punjab later on as well. Furthermore, the writer has endorsed the fact that Birdarism is one of the main mobilization forces in the politics of rural Punjab (Javid, 2012, pp. 2-32).

Moreover, Dr. Mughees Ahmed has explained the voting trends of rural and urban Punjab in which local political culture dominates the voting behavior. In this context, biradaries and caste clusters are vital sources for the candidates to get support. The writer has provided a detailed description that how the notion of cultivators vs non-cultivators and later rural and urban division have colonial roots. Under the Punjab Alienation Land Act of 1901, the non-cultivators (Kammi) were proscribed from buying any cultivated land. In addition, under British Raj, the agriculturist and landowners based on Biradari and clans were more empowered in terms of government jobs and socio-political status. For this reason, this trend remained dominant in the politics of Punjab even after independence. The writer has further explained the political dynamics of constituencies in Faisalabad which provides an insight into the politics of central Punjab. The Biradari factor dominated the voting in the general elections from 1977-2002 in the rural areas as compared to urban areas signifying that the landowner Biradari remained popular within their constituencies as 74 percent of the people voted on the basis of Biradari factor. Main stream political parties also gave tickets to the candidates based on Biradari and clan elements.

Besides this, Andrew R. Wilder has analyzed the main electoral trends in Punjab by comparing the political patterns in the 1993 and 1998 general elections. Wilder took the data of polling stations to identify the main trends that include difference of male and female population voting behavior, class difference, the voting behavior of government employees, regional difference, and urban-rural divide. It was being observed that the women vote bank of PPP was higher as compared to PML-N mainly due to the leadership factor of Benazir Bhutto. In addition, women were not independent in deciding to choose among candidates rather it was a family decision and mainly the instructions of the male members that influence the casting of the female vote. Furthermore, it is being explained that the popular perception that PPP had more support within the poor and rural strata of society and PML-N have been more popular in the middle and upper class persisted in the analysis of Wilder on general elections as results from the constituencies of Lahore, Faisalabad, and Gujranwala endorse that PPP got more support from poor strata in the urban areas as well and PML-N from the middle and upper class (Wilder, 1995, pp. 337-393). Another very interesting observation was the voting pattern of civilian and military government employees who cast the vote through postal ballot. The result shows that

most of the government employees and bureaucratic sector cast their vote to PML-N in Punjab. In addition, Andrew R. Wilder's observation on the regional electoral patterns of Punjab in the general elections of 1993 and 1998 gives an insight into the vary voting patterns and electoral trends in the province. Pakistan Muslim League – Nawaz (PML-N) gradually dominated the political landscape of the northern Punjab region whereas Pakistan People's Party (PPP) gained from rural areas of Jhelum and Chakwal in the 1993 elections. Central Punjab, one of the most economically potential areas of Punjab influences the provincial assembly and its legislative politics. PML-N and PPP had a close contestation in the 1993 general elections. But in 1998, the percentage of votes of PML-N significantly increased. On the other hand, the southern Punjab region is dominated by the electable belonging to agriculturists while the political patterns of the western Punjab region predominately revolve around feudalism and tribalism.

Besides this, Rasul Bakhsh Rais has highlighted three major trends about politics in Punjab. Firstly, Punjab is the center of politics for leaders and political parties. Secondly, the writer has endorsed that the swing factor in elections of Punjab is not a dominant factor. Rather traditionally election contest was between two major parties, i.e., Pakistan People's Party (PPP) and Pakistan Muslim League (PML-N) but since the 2013 general elections, Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) is a new factor in Punjab constituencies. Thirdly, the influence and role of feudal families are significant in Punjab politics. Therefore, electable plays a vital role in constituency-based politics (Rais, 2017).

Therefore, the above discussion entails that most of the scholars have derived the following factors that have a vital role in the electoral politics of Punjab that incorporates multifaceted features in electoral dynamics.

Material and Methods

For this research, the questionnaire technique was used as the method of primary data collection to get the opinion of registered voters of Punjab. Total 87 samples responded through an online survey system. Purposive sampling was used to draw out the sample size to ensure that the sample covers the north, southern, central, and western constituencies of Punjab. Both male and female gender was part of the study. In addition, the minimum qualification of the respondents was undergraduate.

Major Electoral Trends in the Punjab Province of Pakistan

Electoral trends in Punjab reflect the political culture, sociological traits, and cognitive patterns in the society towards politics. Along with the traditional political traits, increased youth participation, non-traditional mechanisms of participation including social media, and consistency in the process of elections are all contributing factors in understanding the electoral politics and voting behavior of the people of Pakistan and Punjab in particular. In this context, the following factors were identified to understand the voting patterns of the people of Punjab.

The Rural-Urban Factor

It is being observed that voting behavior in Punjab varies in different geographic regions. The main variance exists between the urban and the rural areas. The rural population of Punjab is 68.7 percent and the urban population accounts for 31.3 percent (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics). Political party affiliation, party manifesto, the general performance of the political party in governance, and family relationships are some main features that people living in the urban and city centers of Punjab adhere to caste vote for the candidate whereas the rural centers mainly adhere to the local grouping, the influence of land-owned elites, Biradari and clan affiliation, and mostly the popular political party at the time of election campaign. In this context, the following questions were asked by the respondents related to the pattern of urban-rural voting behavior.

Table 1
Do you think that voting patterns in rural and urban areas are different in Punjab?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	68	78.2	78.2	78.2
	Disagree	12	13.8	13.8	92.0
	Don't Know	7	8.0	8.0	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0	

In this perspective, 78.2 percent of the respondents agreed that urban-rural voting patterns are different in Punjab. The above results complement the existing literature on urban-rural voting patterns in Punjab. It is being observed that kinship, caste, and local political culture are the predominant factors that define the voting patterns in villages (Bakht, 2019, pp. 192-202). Besides this, another contemporary factor that influences urban-rural voting behavior is the element of electronic and social media. It has increased the level of awareness and participation both in urban and rural areas.

Political Groupings and Personality

Political grouping (Dharra) and personality is another predominant feature in constituency politics. Though local grouping and constituency-based political dynamics have not been much space within the academic discussions, it has been one of the most important aspect of electoral politics. Every constituency has its indigenous distinct features, level of political participation, election and political rivalries. In this context, the majority of the people accounting for 78.2 percent of the population as per the survey agreed with the role and impact of local groupings in constituency politics. Local group dynamics revolve around traditional family ties, rivalries, caste, biradari and powerful influence in the area. Therefore, local allegiance tends to be a decisive factor in most of the constituencies of Punjab.

In addition, the personality profile of the candidate itself is an important factor in the electoral dynamics of Punjab. Several personality approaches to political behavior explain that personality traits and values of the candidates, their belief system, political ideology, social and moral standing along with leadership ability, competence and experience all shape up the political preferences of the voters (Vecchione, 2013). In this perspective, Alan S. Gerber has explained a comprehensive relationship between political participation and personality traits. He

has implied the Five-Factor Model (FFM) of personality to analyze the various forms of personality stimuli on three categories of participation including voting behavior in general elections, participating in national political campaigns, and thirdly participating in local and community politics. The writer suggests that people with Extraversion trait are more sociable and assertive, people with Agreeableness tendency will be more modest, altruist and sympathetic, whereas people with conscientious tends to be more dutiful and complying with the rules. On the other hand, personality traits like emotional stability and openness to experience are more likely to be having a problem-solving approach (Alan S. Gerber, 2011, pp. 692-706). Consequently, people develop a particular perception about the candidates based on their personality characters which also affects the voting turnout and support system.

The perception of the voters about the candidates sets the pattern of electoral trends. Moreover, candidates from traditional strong families mostly have strong and influential roles within their area and clan.

Table 2
Do you think that people caste vote on the basis of local grouping and personality in the constituency?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	68	78.2	78.2	78.2
	Disagree	18	20.7	20.7	98.9
	Don't Know	1	1.1	1.1	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0	

In this context, ample examples can have observed in Punjab where specific personalities emerged as popular leaders at the local as well as the national level. In addition, they served in important political positions at the provincial and national levels. For instance, Chaudhary brothers from Gujrat, Sharif brothers from Lahore, Ghulam Mustafa Khar from Muzaffargarh, Syeda Abida Hussain, Makhdoom Faisal Saleh Hayat from Jhang, Makhdoom Javed Hashmi, Yousaf Raza Gillani and Shah Mehmood Quershi from Multan, Farooq Leghari from Dera Ghazi Khan etc.

Party Affiliations

Political parties are the main carriers of demand in a democratic system. In addition, political parties contest elections through a constitutional process to come in power. Consequently, political parties have a vital role in the overall electoral dynamics of the state. They field their candidates in the elections by rigorously opting for a cost-benefit calculus. Currently, in Punjab, there are three main political parties, i.e. PML-N, PPP, and PTI. Pakistan People’s Party remained popular in Punjab in the 1970 General Elections and secured a two-third majority of seats in Punjab. Then gradually from 1988, PPP started losing strength in Punjab (Ayoob, 1972, pp. 215-219). It was in the General Elections of 1997 that PML-N swept and then remained a popular political party in Punjab. Eventually, it was in 2011 that PTI emerged as a new factor in Punjab. PTI staged a big procession in Minar-e-Pakistan Lahore and consequently, their politics gained momentum. Though in the 2013 general elections, PTI won 30 seats, but most of them were from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Even in the 2018 general elections, most of the seats in Punjab were scored by PML-N, but PTI was able to a form provincial government with the coalition. In addition, religious political parties also have support in some particular constituencies of Punjab but they have

been unable to gain any major victory in terms of the seat. Recently, Tehreek Labiak Pakistan (TLP) is a new phenomenon in Punjab politics. It is being observed that though they have not won in elections, but they have been able to squeeze the margin of victory for the other political parties by securing few thousand votes. In this context, 67.8 percent of the respondents agreed that they cast their vote keeping in view their political party affiliation, while 32 percent of the respondents did not agree (Liaqat, 2019). Even the existing literature on Punjab reveals that political party affiliation is conditioned with the other factors that include local grouping, general political wave before elections and the relationship and status of the candidate within the party cadre.

Table 3
Do you think that people only cast vote on the basis of their political party affiliation?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	59	67.8	67.8	67.8
	Disagree	28	32.2	32.2	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0	

The Caste, Biradari and Sect Factor

Within the electoral culture of the sub-continent, caste and biradari have been one of major factors in shaping political behavior and choice of vote. Therefore, even after independence Pakistan inherited the culture of conceiving caste as an integral part of political campaigns, voting behavior, and support system (Karim, 2014). Most of the existing literature comprehends the significance of caste, biradari and religious sect as decisive factors in the rural politics of Punjab. Caste and biradaris including Makhdoms/ Quershi, Jutt, Kharl, Watoos, Mughal, Arain, Kashmiri, Gujjar, Awan, Khokar, Janjua, Malik, Dogar, Paracha, Bodla, Khanzada, Kasuri, Chaudary, Leghari, Bosan, Marath reside in Punjab. On the other hand, traditionally, the binary sectarian division between Sunni and Shia sects is also one of the sources of attaining political support based on religious ideology. In the recent past, the sect-based division within the Sunni sect particularly between Deoband, Barelvi, and Ahl e Hadith has also implications on the electoral trends in Punjab. The emergence of Tehrek Labaik Pakistan (TLP), a Barelvi group transformed into a political party illustrates this trend. Punjab became the major vote bank of TLP. Though they did not get any major success in the General elections of 2018, their candidates were placed at third number in 62 constituencies in Punjab (Chaudhry, 2018). In this context, there was a mixed response by the sample population, unlike the traditional patterns. Though, 56.3 percent of the people endorsed that caste, biradari and religious sect are an important source of voting behavior in Punjab, but on the same hand, a propionate of 35.6 percent people negated with the importance of caste, biradari, and the feature of the religious sect, whereas 8 percent of the respondents were indecisive. There are several factors that explicates this new trend which includes the rise of youth bulge which accounts for sixty-four percent of Pakistan's population, the renewed role and participatory trends within the political parties, the socio-cultural and economic change in the villages including education level, economic standing and diverse agricultural activities (Usman, 2016, pp. 605-616) along with the increased use of social media platforms and increased urbanization all contributes in slightly reducing the

significance of caste, biradari, and religious sect factor as the only factors in electoral trends in Pakistan and Punjab in particular.

Table 4
Do you think that caste, biradari and religious sect is an important source of voting behavior in Punjab?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	49	56.3	56.3	56.3
	Disagree	31	35.6	35.6	92.0
	Don't Know	7	8.0	8.0	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0	

Issue Based Local Politics

The dynamics of local politics are different from national politics in terms of the nature of socio-political and economic issues. Constituency based local issues incorporates minor as well as major issues within the societal cadre ranging from personal to town level matters. People seek support and help from the candidate for the resolution of their problems. Consequently, this aspect of local dynamics becomes a decisive factor in the voting behavior of people. Local issues in Punjab and elsewhere mostly include infrastructural and development-related issues, non-availability of basic services including health, education, social services, and other matters related to government offices. In addition, politicians are also part of informal mechanisms of conflict resolution, management, and settlement in local matters. In this perspective, the majority of the 73% percent population endorsed this narrative that people give more importance to constituency-based issues as compared to national issues in casting their vote mainly due to the dominant role of candidates in their domestic matters. This trend further provides dominance and stronghold to the candidates on the voters in their areas. This local relationship with the voter and the candidate is one of the most important and decisive factors in Punjab politics.

Table 5
Do you think that people give more importance to their local constituency issues in comparison national issues while casting the vote?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	64	73.6	73.6	73.6
	Disagree	20	23.0	23.0	96.6
	Don't Know	3	3.4	3.4	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0	

Performance of Previous Government

The parameter of performance of candidates in their area and the overall performance of the government is an important scale of measuring the tendency of voters towards the candidate and the political party. Generically, the performance of the government shapes up an environment for the next elections in terms of people's support and the level of satisfaction that they have with the government. Evaluations on the overall economic and security situation are the most common factors that are observed by the voters. Unlike, any macroeconomic and strategic planning, people are more concerned about issues related to inflation, employment, and

security (Voting Behavior in the 2008 Elections). Consequently, most of the candidates also seek part tickets keeping in view the general electoral trend towards a particular party or group. Therefore, this survey also postulates the performance of the previous government is one of the determining factors in shaping up the opinion of the voters. Sixty-nine percent of the people agreed that the performance card of the previous government and the association of candidate with that government is substantial whereas approximately 26% of the respondents negated this proposition.

Table 6
Do you think that people support a candidate on the basis of the performance of previous government?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	60	69.0	72.4
	Disagree	23	26.4	98.9
	Don't Know	1	1.1	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0

External Factors- Establishment and Bureaucratic Maneuvering

Apolitical and impersonal bureaucracy and the establishment are central to the functioning of the state. The bureaucratic hierarchy at the central and provincial has been deeply embedded in the governance structure of Punjab since the colonial era (Shahzad, 2017, pp. 17-20). Bureaucracy includes the civil servants and establishment in Pakistan is a notion that is mostly used for armed forces and other influential elites in Pakistan. Even after the independence of Pakistan, a proportionate ratio of civil servants and military personnel from Punjab were recruited from Punjab mainly due to the population and education ratio of the province. Due to long years of dictatorship, poor governance of democratic regimes, lack of decentralization mechanisms and weak political leadership, the role of establishment and bureaucracy have been significantly increased in Pakistan politics. On the other hand, the role of the military in the politics of Pakistan has been twofold. Traditionally military established a direct role in politics by overthrowing the democratic regimes. Besides this, they had been an influential factor and source of a power center in policy-making during democratic regimes as well. Due to their strong position and role in governance, bureaucracy and pockets within the establishment have been politicized. In this context, 75.9 percent of the respondents agreed that bureaucracy and establishment has a profound role in Punjab politics. Managing political regimes, electable and election day engineering are mostly maneuvered by them. This perception of respondents also gives an insight that to what extent people believe in the role of external factors that can influence the whole electoral process.

Table 7
Do you think that during elections bureaucratic and establishment maneuvering is a significant factor in Punjab politics?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	66	75.9	77.0
	Disagree	11	12.6	89.7

Don't Know	9	10.3	10.3	100.0
Total	87	100.0	100.0	

The Role of Independent Candidates

The role of independent candidates in Punjab is central in understanding the electoral dynamics and post-election settlements to form the government at the provincial and national levels. The culture of contesting as an independent candidate is popular particularly in the Southern Punjab region where candidates on the basis of family, cast and group support contest elections and later on join the ruling party. Consequently, independent candidates and small political parties take a central position in post-election settlements in the formation of the government. For instance, in the 2013 general elections, 12 national assembly independent candidates from Punjab joined PML-N as they were in the position to form the government (www.tribune.com.pk, 2013). Then, in the 2018 general elections, both PML-N and PTI were somehow dependent on 29 independent candidates from Punjab to form the provincial and national government (www.tribune.com.pk, 2018). Usually in such situations, the candidates are in a good bargaining position and they mostly demand a portfolio in the government. In this context, the survey data also endorse this narrative as approximately 64 percent of the respondents agreed that independent candidates have a decisive role in the political dynamics of Punjab after elections. On the other hand, around 26 percent of the respondents did not agree with the decisive role of independent candidates after elections.

Table 8
Do you think that independent candidates become decisive factor in Punjab politics after elections?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	56	64.4	64.4	67.8
	Disagree	23	26.4	26.4	94.3
	Don't Know	5	5.7	5.7	100.0
	Total	87	100.0	100.0	

Conclusion

The electoral dynamics of Punjab are dominated by a combination of traditional and new factors including local dynamics, party politics, cast, and biradari factors along with the cognitive features of local personalities. In addition, being the most important and largest province in terms of a number of candidates, the overall wave of election environment of Punjab has implications in the center as well. Besides this, political maneuvering by the establishment has been increased in Punjab. The survey indicates that people believe that they play an acute role in the whole process of pre and post-election phase that have a negative impact on the democratic norms. Moreover, it is being observed that along with the role of political parties, independent candidates are also a significant factor in the politics of Punjab.

References

- (2013, May 22). 12 independent candidates from Punjab join PML-N in NA, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/552839/12-independent-candidates-from-punjab-join-pml-n-in-na>
- (2018, July 29). Independents to decree PTI, PML-N fate in Punjab, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1768513/independents-decree-pti-pml-n-fate-punjab>
- Ahmad, S. (2018). *Unleashing the potential of a young Pakistan*. UNDP: Human Development Reports.
- Alan S. Gerber, G. A. (2011). Personality Traits and Participation in Political Processes. *The Journal of Politics*, 73(3), 692-706.
- Ayoob, M. (1972). Profile of a Party: PPP in Pakistan. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 7(5/7), 215-219.
- Bakht, N. H. (2019). Impact of Caste and Biradari System on Voting Behavior: Comparative Study of Rural and Urban Southern Punjab (District Bahawalpur). *Pakistan Vision*, 20(2), 192-202.
- Chaudhry, R. (2018, August 16). Mobilising the Bareilvi vote: is TLP more than a one-Dawn
- Javid, H. (2012). Class, Power, and Patronage: The Landed Elite and Politics in Pakistani Punjab. *The London School of Economics and Political Science*, 2-32.
- Karim, A. S. (2014). Impact of Caste System on Voting Behavior: A Comparative Study of Punjab (Pakistan) and Bihar (India) Affecting Process of Democratization of a Political Society. *New Horizons*, 8(2).
- Liaqat, J. N. (2019). *Political Connections and Vote Choice: Evidence from Pakistan*. https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/asadliaqat/files/liaqat_et_al._political_connections_vote_choice.pdf
- Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, G. o. (n.d.). *Area, population, density and urban/rural proportion by Admin. Units* <https://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files//tables/AREA%20POPULATION%20DENSITY%20AND%20URBAN%20RURAL%20PROPORTION.pdf>
- Rais, R. B. (2017, November 1). *Politics in Punjab*, *The Express Tribune*, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1546330/politics-in-punjab>
- Shahzad, A. K. (2017). Crisis of Governance in The Bureaucracy of Pakistan: A Study of Administrative Ramifications with Apposite Policy Recommendations. *ISSRA Papers*, 17-20. https://www.ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra_pub/articles/issra-paper/ISSRA_Papers_2nd-Half-2017/06.CRISIS-OF-GOVERNANCE-IN-THE-BUREAUCRACY.pdf
- Usman, A. (2016). Marginalized voters and supporters: Biradari system, caste hierarchy and rights to political participation in rural Punjab. *Journal of Political Studies*, 23(2), 605-616.

Vecchione, G. V. (2013). *The Oxford Handbook of Political Psychology*. Oxford Handbook Online.

Scavo, Carmine & Prysby, Charles (2008.). Voting Behavior in the 2008 Elections. *Institute of Social Research, University of Michigan*.
<https://www.icpsr.umich.edu/web/pages/instructors/setup2008/background/government-performance.html>

Wilder, A. R. (1995). Changing Patterns of Punjab Politics in Pakistan: National Assembly Election Results. *Asian Security*, 35(4), 337-393.