



RESEARCH PAPER

Understanding the Evolution and Future Scenarios of Business-to-Business Marketing in Pakistan: An Explanatory Sequential Mixed-Method Approach

¹Muhammad Ali¹ and Dr. Zahid Yousaf²

1. PhD Scholar, Centre for Media and Communication University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Centre for Media and Communication. University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Punjab, Pakistan

PAPER INFO ABSTRACT

Received:

June 27, 2021

Accepted:

September 21, 2021

Online:

September 25, 2021

Keywords:

Digital Marketing,
Business-to-Business (B2B)
Marketing,
Online Promotion,
Advertising
Professionals,
Industry
Perceptions

***Corresponding
Author**

m.ali@fjwu.edu.pk

The rapid growth of digital technologies has converted advertising practices and commercial activities worldwide, including business-to-business (B2B) marketing in evolving economies such as Pakistan. Online platforms are being extensively used by business organizations to access global markets within the world. The present research seeks to investigate the role and relevance of digital promotion within the inter-firm marketing context. Online platforms are also becoming the influence in commercial transactions in emerging economies like Pakistan, but there is a paucity of empirical qualitative studies on the industry view. This study explores the role and future prospects of digital advancement using a mixed-methods approach. A survey of 225 participants drawn from three principal urban regions of Pakistan, analyzed through channel expansion theory shows that digital tools strongly support organizational growth, with experience and modernization in technology sector as a key enabler. In addition, fifteen in-depth interviews with advertising agencies, interpreted by Media system dependency theory which reveals optimism about business to business (B2B) marketing due to its accessibility, cost effectiveness and measurability. The study investigates that online marketing on the B2B type is a strategic need, and not an option in the future of the Pakistani businesses. To speed up the adoption, it is recommended to support the policies, provide professional training, and invest in technology.

Introduction

Online advertising is now a better business-to-business model of promoting consumer allegiance and meeting corporate objectives. The most recent media

technology has transformed the marketing landscape, Marketers are adopting systematic methods of reaching target markets and affecting decision making (Habes et al., 2020). Inter-organizational marketing especially in the use of emerging technologies has been outstanding in Pakistan. Social media in the business environment represents one-way exposure to products and services, all these platforms make communication easier and assist in meeting customer needs (Amjad, 2015). The internet promotion involves the use of the internet to convey communication messages to large numbers of people. The incorporation of contemporary tools and practices has changed the way promotions are conducted (Alghizzawi et al., 2019). Therefore, improvement of digital promotion can strengthen the relationship between the advertisers and consumers along with positive brand perception. The speed with which online spaces grow also facilitates reduction in the gap in interaction between the customers and the service providers (Hill, 2007).

The number of online consumers will keep on rising, with the recent global usage of the Internet of about three billion individuals and an average growth rate of 20 percent per annum average during the last one decade, the number of internet users has tremendously increased to billions across the world (Internet World Stats, 2015) As the number of people using social networks is constantly increasing, the buyers, sellers, and marketers are also likely to be more inclined to the digital setting (Datta et al., 2018). Digital marketing is a blend of new methods of promotion and new strategies (Jolly et al., 2020). In this case, the objectives are to increase the efforts, inject effort in relatively competitive fronts and use the available resources to seek alternative sources of revenue generation (Jobber and Fahy, 2009). The potential of internet marketing is evidenced when over 85 per cent of the social media users in Europe indicated that they were online purchasing their products in 2012, which has presented greater prospects of digital promotion implementation (IAB Europe, 2012).

The digital transformation has transformed modern marketing ecosystems by adopting the use of communication technologies, data analytics, and interactive media to carry out business activities. Digital channels have become very important to organizations to reach the stakeholders, promote products, and manage relationships. According to the scholars, digital media has transformed the traditional marketing framework since firms can now access the international market faster and more efficiently than ever before (Alnaser et al., 2020; Habes et al., 2020).

Though these trends exist all over the world, online B2B marketing in the developing economies is not an evenly spread practice. With a fast-growing rates of internet penetration and social media usage, Pakistan nevertheless lacks extensive scholarly research on the industry perceptions and the willingness to undergo the digital transformation. Thus, this paper seeks to address this gap by investigating the perception of the advertising practitioners about the future of online B2B marketing in Pakistani context.

Digital technologies are reshaping advertising and B2B marketing in Pakistan. This study explores the role and future prospects of digital promotion using a mixed-

methods approach. A survey of 225 participants across major urban regions, analyzed through Channel Expansion Theory, shows that digital tools strongly support organizational growth, with experience and technological modernization as key enablers.

The study assesses the impact of inter-organizational online promotion on customer attitude, analyzes the impacts of service delivery, and finds the impacts of online marketing implementation (Ohajionu and Mathews, 2015). They state that online media presents greater opportunities and a promising future for business organizations because of its convenient accessibility and immediate communication. Such access is much more effective and secure to both buyers and the sellers especially in business-to-business marketing.

Although digital marketing is growing all over the world, this study examines the role and future prospects of digital advancement in Pakistan using a mixed-methods approach. Unlike mode existing research, which primarily focuses on consumer-behavior based as opposed to industry perceptions. That is why such a deficiency in qualitative understanding constrains the capacity of policy makers and practitioners to develop effective digital transformation strategies. By integrating qualitative interviews and quantitative surveys, this research investigates advertising professionals regarding the opportunities, the challenges, and the future of online B2B marketing in Pakistan. Which provides a comprehensive understanding that can inform policy development and decision making.

Literature Review

The internet advertising involves various tools including email campaigns, optimization of the search engine, and social media promotion. The tools enable companies to attract heads of staff, transact, and study customer patterns (Lee and Cho, 2020). Digital marketing has a wider coverage and a higher level of flexibility compared to the conventional advertising (Ohajionu and Mathews, 2015).

Companies are also able to create campaigns independently and track performance indicators, which allows them to constantly refine marketing policies (Alghizzawi et al., 2019). These features are what render online B2B marketing quite appealing to companies that are looking to expand at a comparatively low cost. It has been shown that the effectiveness of marketing is enhanced by exposure to digital platforms because it allows the companies to reach the audiences with the appropriate accuracy and create a long-term relationship (Javed and Amjad, 2015). Moreover, the internet marketing can ensure close contact between the business and customers, eliminating intermediaries and transaction costs (Bostanshirin, 2016).

Past researches have shown a clear distinction between inter-organizational marketing (B2B) and consumer-oriented marketing (B2C). Further on, however, researchers noted that the distinction between industrial and consumer markets has faded away over the years (Khokar, 2016). Phil and Arrow (2015) compared the B2B operations with individual consumer marketing on the basis of exchanged offers and

nature of participation. According to these key distinctions, this difference caused the researchers to create customized promotional strategies in every market place (Presbry, 2009). The sites have become the main promotional support systems of organizations. Almost half of the world online population is located in Asia, which implies that online advertising can be developed successfully in the emerging markets (Constantinides, 2014). More connection has contributed significantly to communication, information sharing, and business transactions (Turban et al., 2018).

B2B advertising is very critical in economic enhancement via online platforms. Even more in the future, the use of enhanced digital promotional techniques has also helped in the practice of better online marketing (Matthyssens et al., 2008). Companies involved in marketing operations have to embrace broader strategic orientations. B2B marketing drives strategies and tactics that would allow sellers and customers to gain and keep more revenue which is part of this revolution.

However, in contrast, in a consumer-driven marketing, the use of the web is highly conditioned by the changing user preferences and new technological benefits (Hameed, 2014). The application of web-technologies in business-to-business marketing is largely determined by the marketing needs since companies can use web technologies to enhance business operations, customer and supplier records (Akber et al., 2013).

Alghizzawi et al. (2019) emphasized that the provision of clear availability and visibility of products helps customers because it will lessen uncertainty. Indicatively, the consumers in the high-tech markets are more exposed to products and services and are knowledgeable of their quality. Competition and loyalty factors make relations between vendors and clients more complicated, and the information about the product standards is more informed in technologically developed markets (Ali et al., 2019). In this regard, these environments are sensitive especially when it comes to preserving good relationship that are strong to support the process of delivering products and services (Ohajionu and Mathews, 2015).

Digital promotion is in 24/7 operation with 24/7 accessibility and efficient service aspects. The advertisement in the online media is not restricted as is the case with traditional media. This is why online advertising can be considered one of the most popular, and their result is fruitful (Wadhawan, 2016). Furthermore, advertising is also being made easier by the rising popularity of social networking websites since various sites are accessed by large global audience. A variety of online news and leisure services, delivery of information and communication systems is also present today. This enables users to move to different sites, in search of their preferred content and this gives them a chance to be exposed to online adverts (Ibrahim, 2012).

Online advertisement is the trend in Pakistan due to the viability, cost-effectiveness and user-friendliness. These strategies aim to capture the attention of the audience and influence their cognition of the existing goods and services (Talha, 2011), as digital promotion in Pakistan keeps on progressing with the global

technological trends and technological advances that influence the changing business landscape. Nevertheless, there were hardly any Internet-based marketing resources in Pakistan a few years ago, and promotion mainly depended on the media marketing trends (Hadabi and Almsafir, 2013).

As the number of people using the internet grows, online advertising has become popular in Pakistan (Nizam et al., 2018). At the onset, many companies began promoting their products on the available digital platforms (Rahman et al., 2018). The promotion through the digital platform received an additional push because of the emergence of new businesses. To achieve an edge in competition, online platforms were motivated by new organizations to be more vigilant and strategic, and online advertising has transformed the context of advertisement in Pakistan (Haider & Shakib, 2018). Moreover, the international organizations have started considering Pakistan as a promising market and growing their online promotional operations in the country (Ahmed et al., 2019).

The inter-organizational marketing interaction structure between customers and suppliers is a comparatively rare but complicated phenomenon, which is based on both transactional interactions and cooperative interactions (Tiding, 2017). What makes this complexity worse is the fact that organizational purchases are not personal and many people are involved including decision-making personnel (Bandgar, 2014). Gilliland and Johnston (2017) pointed out that the goal of B2B promotion activities is to attract and persuade bidders, stakeholders, customers, and suppliers to influence the outcomes of decisions and demand a properly designed persuasive campaign.

In fact, Electronic Data Interchange and just-in-time delivery are some of the initiatives that have enhanced customer and seller relations in business-to-business marketing environments. The enhanced relations have resulted in the implementation of activities like logistics and building. Additionally, new frameworks and modes of marketing have transformed traditional business-to-business marketing severely because of the web-based technologies (Grundmeyer, 2012). There is no doubt that online transactions also feature significantly in business-to-business transactions to enable the buyer and seller to transact with each other. Nonetheless, the business-to-business marketing is characterized by complicated patterns of sellers and buyers' communication as well (Pishva, 2013).

Moreover, the recent analysis indicates that social media and digital platforms are now considered strategic in the business-to-business marketing context, as well as facilitates sales, enhances the communication and interaction between employees, and the long-term relations between buyers and sellers (Jari Salo, 2017).

The use of online platforms has changed the way PR has been practiced in the past because organizations are able to interact with their stakeholders. By sharing product experiences online, users will affect the purchase decision and brand loyalty (Kirat, 2007; Latif et al., 2014). Research indicates that active social networking on the internet is very powerful in fortifying the corporate image and customer loyalty (Bhargava, 2010). Furthermore, a significant percentage of the world companies rely

on the social media to sustain relationships with clients and partners. Brief, to-the-point messages have been proven to enhance the interactions of the audience as opposed to long promotional messages (Kirat, 2007).

Hypotheses

H₁: There is a substantial change in the perceptions of consumers in relation to online B2B advertising depending on the demographic features of consumers.

H₂: On-line experience is a significant positive influence on perceptions of on-line advertising of B2B.

H₃: The research concludes that adoption of new technologies and methods plays a great positive role in the perceptions of online B2B advertising.

Theoretical Framework

This study is based on mix method framework integrating Media System Dependency Theory and Channel Expansion Theory to examine the usage and perception of business-to-business marketing in Pakistan. Media System Dependency Theory states that people and organizations become more dependent on media systems to get information, make decisions, and communicate (Ball-Rokeach, 2010). According to the theory, the more media reliance, the greater the influence on the attitudes and behaviors. When it comes to digital marketing, online platforms help businesses to gain access to market information, interact with partners, and advertise the products. Researchers point to a close connection between the tendencies of digital media use and dependency (Jung, 2017; Loveless, 2008). This model offers a relevant perspective on the reasons why companies use online B2B marketing models.

Whereas, Channel Expansion Theory offers a good theoretical justification to the present research. According to Germonprez (2002), the selection of the preferred platform to use in communication, information and entertainment depends on what we thought about the medium. The primary source of information is the social media, and it has been adopted easily today. Rains (2008) also confirms this opinion, believing that Channel Expansion Theory can be applied to a new type of media and traditional media. Deursen and Pieterse (2000) further to discuss the way in which the development of digital media has altered the role of traditional communication mediums. Nonetheless, the first little attention was paid by researchers to Channel Expansion Theory. Zimmerman and Blythe (2013) studied the patterns of organizational communication and perspectives of the participants. The authors simply evaluated the e-mail as a medium of communication with an aim of offering a new perspective to Channel Expansion Theory.

Besides, their analysis touched upon relations between perceived digital competence of the users and their positive attitudes to the Internet as an efficient medium of communication, exchange of information and learning (Yang et al, 2011).

Commercial organizations to give special attention to the online media as a marketing tool. Persuasive decision-making has been a significant issue because of the enhanced communication and direct approach to consumers (Duffy, 2005). Online platforms are used to make products more noticeable and accessible to customers by the marketer (Israel and Wilson, 2006). New media is highly enhancing commercial interests regardless of the criticism of researchers, policymakers, and stakeholders, as customers and marketers enjoy rapid accessibility as well as its effectiveness, visibility, adaptability, and similar features that make them stand out (Hanekom and Scriven, 2002).

By adopting mix method approach this study measure the digital adoption and perceived effectiveness to cover the insight of advertising professionals. These theories helps to interpret the experiences and shape the attitude of online business to business marketing, these theories provide the robust framework for understanding both in-depth perceptions and statistical trends of digital B2B marketing in Pakistan.

Material and Methods

This study adopted mixed method approach to explore the perceptions of advertisers and clients regarding online B2B marketing in Pakistan. By integrating qualitative and quantitative methods, researcher grounded both in-depth interviews and measurable trends for cohesive understanding of phenomena.

Research Design

Qualitative descriptive methodology was employed in order to get a closer understanding of the perceptions of the participants. The qualitative study approach will be suitable when investigating intricate social phenomena as well as articulating an in-depth understanding (Ryan et al., 2009). Furthermore, quantitative cross-sectional survey was used to measure the patterns and relationship of B2B adoption among industrial clients for generalizations of stats.

Sampling

The participants were recruited through convenience sampling and were advertising agencies in Islamabad, Lahore and Karachi. The authors used 15 professionals as the sample, which meets the criteria of qualitative research that focus deeper on the understanding rather than generalization of statistics (Etikan, 2016; Sedgwick, 2013). For quantitative survey 225 industrial clients from the urban areas were selected through snowball sampling, this method assists to reach the hard accessing population (Johnson, 2014; Nadeerifar et al., 2017).

Data Collection

The interviews were semi structured, to make participants free to share experiences. Interviews were done on digital marketing strategies, challenges and

future expectation. For quantitative five-point Likert scale was applied to collect data on the perceptions of the industrial clients of online B2B marketing (Ali, 2020).

Data Analysis

Thematic analysis was used. The coding, classification, and interpretation of the responses were done to uncover repetitive trends and themes. In this way, it is possible to conduct a systematic analysis of qualitative data and increase the analytical rigor. For the quantitative the SPSS 64-bit is used for descriptive and multivariate statistical analysis (Akkelen, 2014). Pearson correlation analysis is used to ensure the validity of expert reviews whereas Cronbach alpha is used for checking the reliability (Nili et al., 2017).

Trustworthiness

In order to achieve credibility and reliability:

- The respondents confirmed summaries of their answers (member checking).
- Transcripts of the interviews were also re-read so as to be consistent.
- There was minimal researcher bias achieved by neutral questioning.

This paper was aimed at analyzing the attitudes of clients in terms of the use of digital promotional plans in a business-to-business advertising context. To address this problem, a cross-sectional design was selected, and the study involved the use of structured questionnaires with a five-point Likert scale to collect the answers of the chosen participants since the survey method is the most effective to collect the desired data directly and efficiently (Ali, 2020). The Statistical Package of the Social Sciences was a 64-bit Statistical Package that was used to process the data. According to the author, the software offers a wide array of analytical solutions to the user (Akkelen, 2014). SPSS is a complete statistical processing with descriptive statistics to sophisticated multivariate statistical processing.

Reliability analysis

The numerical coding is an important part of the empirical investigation and the researchers are inclined to employ the quantitative coding to generate quantifiable research outcomes. (Nili et al., 2017). Internal consistency was evaluated using Cronbach alpha to support the relevance and increased applicability of the findings (Alhumaid et al., 2020). Also, the intercoder reliability testing was provided. The alpha of Cronbach is 0.877, which proves that the instrument of the research is very reliable. The intercoder reliability analysis is given in an overview in Table 1 below.

Table 1
Reliability Analysis

Items	Constructs	Cronbach Alpha Value	Status
Hypothesis 1	Demographical Characteristics > Online Advertising	.806	Reliable
Hypothesis 2	Online Experience > Online Advertising	.778	Reliable
Hypothesis H3	Adopting New Technologies & Techniques > Online Advertising	.755	Reliable

Validity of Research Instrument

In quantitative studies, it is a critical part to test the validity of the research instrument. Validity analysis doesn't only assist in confirming the correctness of the research tool, it also explains to what degree the research can deliver verifiable and verified outcomes (Isaac, 2018). There was also a validity test of the current study, which is the univariate Pearson correlation analysis. The instrument of research is valid and statistically significant as observed in Table 2 below.

Table 2
Univariate Pearson Correlation Coefficient

OA	DC	OE	ATT
.834**			
.000			
.780**	.698**		
.000	.000	.011	
.047	.003	.011	.968
.480	.968	.872	.003

Note: DC: Demographical Characteristics, OE: Online Experience, OA: Online Advertising, ATT: Adopting New Technologies and Techniques

Results and Discussion:

Demographical Data of the Study Respondents:

The demographic profile of the respondents is provided in Table 3. The outcomes demonstrate that 181 (80.4) participants were males and 44 (19.6) were females (M = 1.20, SD = .398). With regard to age group, 82 (36.4) respondents were in the 31-45 age bracket, 59 (26.2) were within the 36-40 age bracket, and 32 (14.2) respondents in the 25 years and below age bracket. Also, 25 (11.1) respondents were aged 26-30, 15 (6.7) and 12 (5.3) were aged 41-45 and 46 years or above respectively (M = 3.16, SD = 1.293). Analysis of educational background showed that, 64 (28.4%), 63 (28.0%), 53 (23.5%), 36 (16.0%), and 9 (4.0%) participants had graduate degrees, bachelor, intermediate, matric and higher qualifications respectively (M = 2.86, SD = 1.133). On the whole, the response rate was 100% at the total number of 225 participants.

Table 3

Demographical characteristics of the study respondents:

Criterion	Factor	f	%
Gender	Male	181	80.4%
	Female	44	19.6%
	Count	225	
Age	18-25	32	14.2%
	26-30	25	11.1%
	31-35	82	36.4%
	36-40	59	26.2%
	41-45	15	6.7%
	46 or above	12	5.3%
Education	Matriculations	36	16.0%
	FA/FSC	53	23.5%
	Bachelors	63	28.0%
	Graduation	64	28.4%
	Masters or above	9	4.0%

As per to Habes et al. (2020), OA is very efficient means that can be used to accomplish business goals. This strategy is especially important in the business-to-business marketing setting (Yoon and Kim, 2016). In this research, n = 173 (76.8) out of the respondents affirmed that customers will be able to escape adverts on the internet in case they consider them annoying. Nonetheless, n=172(76.4) respondents also concurred that in case they had a positive experience with agencies of online advertising, then they would choose to see the advertisement. Similarly, n = 130 (57.7 percent) believed that online advertisement is superior to the traditional advertisement because it is more effective and n =112 (49.7 percent) believed that it is more effective. Also, n = 112 (49.7) found that they considered digital advertising agencies to be more influential and n = 121 (53.7) reported that they believe these agencies can add more values to the products. Also, n = 162 (72.0) individuals answered that good services offered by advertising agencies made them think of reconsidering online advertising in the future since it offers a lot of benefits (n = 128, 56.8%). On the same note, a respondent who has good relations with the advertising agencies would be n = 141 (62.6%), and in case they get a benefit, n = 128 (56.8) would results in close communication with agency employees and the quality of services lead to emotional attachment in clients. The affective involvement additionally supported to the fact that n = 120 (53.3%) participants developed positive perception of the advertising agencies and accepted them as n = 148 (65.7%) being dependable in marketable objectives.

Table 4
Descriptive Figures for Online Advertising(OA) in general & Experiences
***Online Advertising=OA**

Factors	M	SD	Variance	Min	Max	N
<i>Predictor Variable: OA in All-purpose</i>						
Skip advertisement	3.51	1.717	2.947	1	5	
Positive individual experience	3.27	1.091	1.190	1	5	225
More effective than the conventional advertisements	3.11	1.433	2.055	1	5	225
OA is more effective						225

OA agency is more Active	3.15	1.386	1.920	1	5	
Creative value for your product	2.92	1.253	1.570	1	5	225
	3.01	1.682	2.830	1	5	225
						225
<i>Explanatory Variable: Online Experience</i>						
Positive reception from consumers	3.85	1.727	2.983	1	5	225
Numerous benefits	3.48	1.296	1.679	1	5	225
Good client-agency relationship	3.46	1.106	1.223	1	5	225
Emotionally involved	3.44	1.671	2.792	1	5	225
Perception of OA	3.40	1.509	2.278	1	5	225
Reliability of OA	3.34	1.225	1.501	1	5	225

Out of the total respondents (n=165) (73.3 percent) who responded, 165 (n=165) decided that the quality of service offered by advertising agencies would contribute completely to their attitudes. Still, n = 158 (67.5%) also anticipated that the agencies be confidential to the personal information of clients. Likewise, 80.8% (n=182) of the respondents responded affirmatively to the fact that the degree of belief in an agency would affect their choices because the access to private information would make them prefer to use online advertising. Their educational level according to n = 180 (80.0) of the participants has an effect on their perception of online advertising, and further those who are more active in using internet also have an impact on n = 151 (67.1) respondents, when it comes to their decision to use online advertisement. Besides, n = 41 (18.2) of respondents expressed their opinions that it can get expensive on their side to use online advertising. Nevertheless, the same sample of n = 180 (84.0) still supported online advertisement because of their cordial relations to advertising agencies.

Table 5
Descriptive Figures for Personal Characteristics (PC) and Online Advertisement

Factors	M	SD	Variance	Min	Max	N
Explanatory Variable: PC	3.43	1.249	1.559	1	5	225
Standard of OA						
Matter of confidentiality/Privacy	3.32	1.355	1.836	1	5	225
Reliance affects your choice	3.01	1.290	1.665	1	5	225
Authority on your info	2.94	1.759	3.094	1	5	225
Education levels	3.57	1.721	2.961	1	5	225
Enhanced net infiltration	3.56	1.263	1.596	1	5	225
Choice of utilizing OA	3.56	1.034	1.069	1	5	225
Acceptance degree of OA	3.68	1.752	3.068	1	5	225

The classic trends of advertising have also been inclined by the increased practice of the digital media. The new online advertising is less expensive, effective and better than the previous ways of advertising (Akber et al., 2013). To further qualify, n = 148 (65.7) of the respondents indicated a tendency to choose digital promotion since it is viewed as convenient, economical and efficient in saving time compared to n = 99 (44.0) who said that it is effective in making the expectations of their expectations come true. Their connections with advertising firms likewise shapes their decisions regarding digital promotional channels because the more efficient the organizations that communicate market updates more effectively strengthen participant loyalty (n = 143 (59.1%)). However, despite this, n = 143 (59.1) respondents confirmed the presence of gaps amongst them and advertising agencies,

however, n = 124 (55.1) of them still evaluate the opportunities in maintaining constructive interaction with digital advertising providers. Consequently, careful evaluation shows that n = 139 (61.7) respondents feel positive that there is a brighter future of digital promotion overall, particularly inter-organizational marketing with in Pakistan.

Table 6
Descriptive Figures for Adopting New Technology and Techniques

Factors	M	SD	Variance	Min	Max	N
<i>Explanatory Variable:</i>						
<i>Accepting/Accepting novel technologies</i>						
Economical & ease	3.37	1.307	1.708	1	5	225
Trend & expectation	3.17	1.512	2.287	1	5	225
Agency's attitude	3.20	1.474	2.172	1	5	225
Nature of information	3.13	1.626	2.643	1	5	225
Gaps between clients and advertising agencies	3.49	1.547	2.394	1	5	225
Evaluation process	3.56	1.407	1.980	1	5	225
The OA industry in Pakistan	3.57	1.256	1.577	1	5	225

Hypotheses Testing

Since this study will involve more independent variables and one dependent variable, a single-factor variance test (ANOVA) together with multivariate regression procedures were considered the most appropriate analytical methods (Grégoire, 2015). In this aspect, ANOVA initially tested the hypothesis: "There are differences in the perceptions of consumers depending on their demographic profile as per online advertisement in Pakistan." Patel (2015) states that the one-way analysis of variance is used to measure homogeneity of variances in the responses. To put it plainly, ANOVA is employed in the assessment of the equivalence or non-equivalence of the means of the collected information. The one-way analysis of variance is presented in very brief in Table 7 below. The results showed that the answers depended on gender, age, and education as it confirmed the first hypothesis that the way clients perceive online marketing depends on their demographic features.

Table 7
Test of Homogeneity of Variance

Criterion	Factors	N	Mean	SD	Levene Statistics	f	Sign
Gender	Male	181	1.20	.398	4.463	.784	.737
	Female	44					
	Total	225					
Age	18-25	32	2.16	1.293	.961	.765	.760
	26-30	25					
	31-35	82					
	36-40	59					
	41-45	15					
	45 or above	12					

Qualification	Matric	36	3.86	1.133	1.008	.283	.999
	Intermediate	53					
	Bachelors	63					
	Graduations	64					
	Masters or	9					
	Above						

To test the first study hypothesis, which is, consumers perceptions in terms of their demographic factors in terms of examining participants' viewpoints based on demographic characteristics within the context of digital promotion in Pakistan (ANOVA). As Patel (2015) has applied, one-way ANOVA in order to determine whether the responses obtained are equal as to their means. ANOVA is used in a simple manner to research the equality / inequality of the population mean of the study population. ANOVA can also be called the single-factor analysis as it involves research on a single dependent or independent variable. In addition to that, the variable can either be ordinal or nominal (Horn, 2008).

Table 8
Multiple Regression Analysis to Test the Study Hypotheses

H	Relationship	B	t-value	f	p-value	Direction	Decision
H2	OE>OA	.907	6.358	345.937	.000	Positive	Supported***
H3	ATT>OA	.202	1.502	510.702	.000	Positive	Supported***

Note: DC: Demographical Characteristics, OE: Online Experience, OA: Online Advertising, ATT: Adopting New Technologies and Techniques

The researcher also employed the methods of multiple regression to perform the additional testing of hypotheses (Alghizzawi et al., 2019). Statistical results containing t-statistics, R-square values, and the probability values were produced and given in Table 8. The results of inferential tests showed that there is statistically significant higher-order relationship among digital advertising, customer experience, and continuous technological progression ($\beta= .807$, $P= .000$), ($\beta= .202$, $P= .000$) respectively.

Whereas the qualitative method findings highlight that the respondents always referred to the internet marketing as cheap, quantifiable and available. A lot of people pointed out that online platforms would enable businesses to customize more ads and track outcomes in real-time. The respondents also stressed that to implement the digital successfully it would be necessary to have specialized skills, strategic planning, and allocation of resources. The majority of participants indicated more corporate investment on digital campaigns. They forecasted further growth as companies will see the business potential of online media. Online advertising was considered credible due to its ability to give comprehensive information about the product and easy channels of communication. The participants concurred that online campaigns need fewer resources as opposed to traditional advertising and cover large populations. Businesses are able to interact directly online, thus making negotiations and decision making fast. Online advertisements can be edited or changed immediately unlike in the case of print media which offers a marketer a lot of control.

Marketers are also able to monitor clicks, impressions and conversions using analytics tools to enhance the performance of a campaign. Digital content stays longer on the shelves and is more visible and has long-term effects. Availability of demographic and behavioral information assists the company to determine target customer segments and tailor marketing techniques.

The digital inter-organizational marketing has several advantages in terms of stakeholders in Pakistan. There are an improved service delivery, products and revenue to the advertising agencies, customers and the sellers. Online marketing has become an inseparable element of the business approach of companies, which brings in income and other advantages despite the traditional media that remain relevant. Online marketing is developing at a very fast rate and marketers employ various online strategies to enable businesses to accomplish their objectives (Khan & Siddiqui, 2013).

Raheem (2013) also emphasized the need of digital promotion in Pakistan, as it is applicable in various business operations. Such features make online marketing relatively more efficient than the traditional methods of marketing (Faiz et al., 2019). To demonstrate an example, online rich overlay advertisement can easily reach and have huge exposure to online users, grabbing their attention and appealing to consumers (Soomro et al., 2012). Understandably, in B2B marketing, the objectives of the two sides are to grow sales, gain customer loyalty and the revenue. To fulfill these objectives, online B2B marketers embrace customer facilitation strategies that are maximum (Gu, 2014). Due to the continued advancement of technology, internet facilitates easy accessibility, exposure and communication of businesses and marketers. Such characteristics render digital marketing more effective as compared to old advertising (Faiz et al., 2019).

The findings can be explained by the research study by Chauhan et al. (2016), which also found out that the demographic factors affect the usage of digital technology in the study. Sophisticated communication tools like social networking sites enable the preferences of the users to integrate into the advertisement process and omit the conventional views of adverts. They are interactive media, allowing two-way and convincing communication to be symmetrical (Gurram et al., 2014). The use and incorporation of digital technology have therefore brought new trends in business and marketing. With its communicating services, the interaction among the sellers and buyers has significantly been transformed. Online communication is offering new avenues especially in the business-to-business (B2B) marketing environment (Hanekom & Scriven, 2002).

The conclusions of the research are in accordance with the results of Bala and Verma (2017), who stated that digital promotion is changing modern marketing & business activities. The use of social networks to create sophisticated communication patterns allows the integration of the preferences of the users into the marketing process and have substituted the traditional advertising strategies which were one-directional and declarative. The interactive media technology enables bi-directional

interaction between the marketers and the consumers (Uusitalo, 2009). On the one hand, the organizations can communicate with their customers directly since it is easy to reach them, and communication is not interrupted. Enhanced client-seller communication is the central factor in successful business because the continuous contact and feedback allow to assess client demands and define the services that they require. Digital media also provides these features and assists in supporting the development of productive connections with prospective customers (Ohajionu & Mathews, 2015). The current investigation further indicated that demographic factors are strongly reflected in perceptions towards online marketing in Pakistan including age, gender, and education. On the same note, the corporate relations have been redefined by the digital media in terms of web-based alliances where the internet advertising supports the corporate sector. Advertisers can use various methods to attract the audience rapidly with its enhanced capacity to disseminate all types of content (Mam, 2020).

The results affirm that advertising practitioners perceive online B2B marketing to be a significant element of business development in the future of Pakistan. These findings are in line with previous research indicating good opportunities of adopting digital marketing (Raval et al., 2014). Likewise, studies show that online advertising is cheaper to do and brings greater income than offline (Alghizzawi, 2018). Although, structural barriers such as inadequate training, technology-related limitations, and resistance to change were also raised by the participants. These issues are best dealt with in order to maximize the potential of digital marketing. The theory of Integrated Marketing Communications backs these findings as well by focusing on the coordinated campaigns and interaction with customers (Za & Tricahyadinata, 2017). Furthermore, B2B web-based solutions generate a win-win situation between customers and suppliers, enhancing the quality of products and brand loyalty (Akber et al., 2013).

Conclusion

This study indicates that online B2B marketing is highly seen by advertising gurus as a revolution to the Pakistani business environment. It is an effective instrument of organizational development due to its benefits, which include cost-effectiveness, availability, adaptability, and performance which can be measured. Although there are still obstacles, strategic investment, skill development and policy support can help to speed up adoption. After all, online B2B marketing is not a new phenomenon but a strategic requirement that companies that aim to remain competitive in the digital economy have to comply with.

Recommendations

This study has some limitations that were related to the study scope and the methodological decisions of the researcher. In addition, snowball sampling was a limitation to the study as well. As such, the researcher recommends that additional literature concerning online marketing and specifically Business-to-Business marketing ought to be presented in order to develop the online marketing over time.

Future studies should focus on Comparing research in developing nations as research consumer attitudes and opinions with the opinion of professionals and analyze company-specific adoption.

Practical Implications

The research provides a number of recommendations:

- In the case of Businesses: Invest in online infrastructure and career development.
- In case of Advertising Agencies: Build online B2B specialized teams.
- To the Policymakers: Enhance internet infrastructure and give incentives to digital innovation.
- In the case of Educational Institutions: Introduction of high-level digital marketing education.

References

- Ahmed, R., Khan, M. A., & Qureshi, J. A. (2019). Digital transformation and marketing trends in Pakistan. *Journal of Marketing Development*, 12(2), 45–60.
- Akber, S., Ali, M., & Khan, S. (2013). Web technologies and business-to-business marketing practices. *International Journal of Business Research*, 8(3), 112–124.
- Akkelen, H. (2014). *SPSS for beginners and intermediate users*. McGraw-Hill Education.
- Alghizzawi, M. (2018). The impact of digital marketing on business performance. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 10(4), 35–44.
- Alghizzawi, M., Habes, M., & Salloum, S. (2019). The role of digital marketing in enhancing brand awareness. *International Journal of Information Technology and Language Studies*, 3(1), 50–60.
- Ali, A. (2020). Research methods in social sciences: Quantitative approaches. *Journal of Social Research Methods*, 15(1), 21–33.
- Ali, S., Rashid, M., & Hussain, T. (2019). Customer loyalty and technological development in emerging markets. *Asian Journal of Business Studies*, 6(2), 77–90.
- Alhumaid, K., Ali, S., & Waheed, A. (2020). Reliability and validity in quantitative research. *Journal of Educational Research*, 13(2), 99–110.
- Alnaser, F., Ghani, M., & Raza, S. (2020). Digital transformation in marketing ecosystems. *International Journal of Digital Business*, 5(1), 1–14.
- Amjad, R. (2015). Social media marketing in Pakistan: Emerging trends and opportunities. *Pakistan Journal of Media Studies*, 9(2), 15–28.
- Ball-Rokeach, S. J. (2010). Media system dependency theory. In *The international encyclopedia of communication*. Wiley-Blackwell.
- Bala, M., & Verma, D. (2017). A critical review of digital marketing. *International Journal of Management, IT & Engineering*, 7(10), 321–339.
- Bandgar, P. (2014). Organizational buying behavior in B2B markets. *International Journal of Business Management*, 4(3), 88–95.
- Bhargava, R. (2010). *Social media marketing strategies*. Wiley.
- Bostanshirin, S. (2016). Online marketing: Challenges and opportunities. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 36, 237–242.
- Constantinides, E. (2014). Foundations of social media marketing. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 148, 40–57.

- Chauhan, V., Choudhary, V., & Mathur, S. (2016). Demographic influences on technology adoption behavior: A study of e-banking services in India. *Prabandhan: Indian Journal of Management*, 9(5), 45–54.
- Datta, P., Chowdhury, D., & Chakraborty, B. (2018). Adoption of digital marketing in emerging economies. *Journal of Business Strategy*, 29(4), 12–20.
- Deursen, A., & Pieterse, W. (2000). The role of digital media in communication transformation. *Journal of Information Science*, 26(5), 379–387.
- Duffy, D. (2005). Persuasive decision-making in digital media. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 45(3), 282–290.
- Etikan, I. (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 1–4.
- Faiz, R., Khan, M., & Ali, H. (2019). Digital marketing effectiveness in Pakistan. *Pakistan Business Review*, 21(3), 455–470.
- Gilliland, D., & Johnston, W. (2017). B2B promotion and stakeholder persuasion. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 32(4), 552–563.
- Grégoire, Y. (2015). ANOVA and regression analysis in social sciences. *Journal of Applied Statistics*, 42(5), 1023–1034.
- Grundmeyer, T. (2012). Electronic data interchange and B2B marketing evolution. *Journal of Digital Commerce*, 7(2), 65–79.
- Gu, X. (2014). Customer facilitation strategies in B2B marketing. *Industrial Marketing Review*, 18(3), 201–210.
- Gurram, S., Reddy, V., & Kumar, P. (2014). Interactive media and advertising communication. *International Journal of Media Studies*, 6(1), 15–24.
- Habes, M., Alghizzawi, M., & Khalaf, R. (2020). Digital marketing practices and business goals. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 12(1), 1–12.
- Hadabi, A., & Almsafir, M. (2013). Marketing trends in developing economies. *International Journal of Economics and Management*, 7(1), 101–115.
- Hameed, S. (2014). Consumer-driven web marketing practices. *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, 22(3), 289–302.
- Hanekom, J., & Scriven, C. (2002). *Advertising techniques and digital evolution*. Juta & Co.
- Hill, R. (2007). Internet marketing communication strategies. *Journal of Marketing Communications*, 13(4), 305–320.

- Horn, R. (2008). Introduction to ANOVA. *Statistical Methods Journal*, 15(2), 100–115.
- IAB Europe. (2012). *European online advertising expenditure report*. IAB Europe.
- Ibrahim, Y. (2012). Online media exposure and advertising effects. *Journal of Communication Studies*, 8(2), 33–47.
- Internet World Stats. (2015). *Internet usage statistics worldwide*. <http://www.internetworldstats.com>
- Isaac, S. (2018). Validity testing in quantitative research. *Journal of Educational Measurement*, 55(2), 123–134.
- Israel, G., & Wilson, K. (2006). Digital visibility in marketing. *Marketing Insights Quarterly*, 19(3), 44–52.
- Javed, M., & Amjad, S. (2015). Digital platform exposure and marketing effectiveness. *Pakistan Journal of Business Research*, 10(2), 75–89.
- Jobber, D., & Fahy, J. (2009). *Foundations of marketing* (2nd ed.). McGraw-Hill.
- Johnson, T. (2014). Snowball sampling in qualitative research. *Research Methodology Journal*, 9(1), 45–55.
- Jolly, V., Singh, R., & Sharma, A. (2020). Emerging digital marketing strategies. *International Journal of Business Innovation*, 11(4), 66–78.
- Jung, J. (2017). Media dependency in digital environments. *Communication Theory Journal*, 27(1), 56–73.
- Khan, S., & Siddiqui, D. (2013). Online marketing trends in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences*, 7(3), 602–615.
- Kirat, M. (2007). Public relations in digital environments. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 19(2), 135–148.
- Khokar, S. (2016). Evolution of B2B and B2C marketing distinction. *Asian Marketing Journal*, 4(2), 25–39.
- Latif, F., Islam, M., & Rahman, A. (2014). Social networking and corporate image. *International Journal of Communication Studies*, 6(4), 221–234.
- Lee, J., & Cho, M. (2020). Email marketing and SEO effectiveness. *Journal of Digital Commerce Research*, 18(2), 88–101.
- Loveless, M. (2008). Media reliance and political attitudes. *European Journal of Communication*, 23(4), 419–437.

- Mam, M. (2020). Corporate communication through digital platforms. *International Journal of Marketing Research*, 12(3), 95–110.
- Matthyssens, P., Vandenbempt, K., & Berghman, L. (2008). Value innovation in B2B markets. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 37(3), 318–330.
- Nadeerifar, M., Goli, H., & Ghaljaie, F. (2017). Snowball sampling method in qualitative research. *Strides in Development of Medical Education*, 14(3), 1–6.
- Nili, A., Tate, M., & Barros, A. (2017). Quantitative coding and reliability in research. *Communications of the AIS*, 40(1), 1–17.
- Nizam, M., Khan, A., & Rehman, S. (2018). Internet usage and advertising growth in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Media Studies*, 12(1), 90–105.
- Ohajionu, U., & Mathews, J. (2015). Online promotion and customer attitudes. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 7(6), 78–89.
- Patel, R. (2015). Applications of ANOVA in social sciences. *Statistical Review Quarterly*, 21(1), 55–68.
- Pishva, D. (2013). Complexity in B2B communication networks. *Journal of Industrial Marketing*, 22(4), 311–320.
- Rahman, F., Ahmed, N., & Khan, R. (2018). Digital promotion in emerging markets. *Journal of Business and Management*, 20(6), 45–54.
- Rains, S. (2008). Channel expansion theory and new media. *Communication Research Reports*, 25(2), 160–168.
- Raval, S., Patel, H., & Shah, D. (2014). Opportunities in digital marketing adoption. *International Journal of Business Studies*, 6(3), 77–88.
- Ryan, G., Coughlan, M., & Cronin, P. (2009). Interviewing in qualitative research. *Nurse Researcher*, 16(4), 30–38.
- Salo, J. (2017). Social media research in the industrial marketing field: Review of literature and future research directions. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 66, 115–129.
- Sedgwick, P. (2013). Snowball sampling. *BMJ*, 347, f7511.
- Soomro, Z., Shah, M., & Ahmed, J. (2012). Online advertising exposure effects. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(9), 123–132.
- Talha, M. (2011). Digital promotion strategies in Pakistan. *Journal of Marketing in Emerging Economies*, 5(1), 33–48.

- Tiding, M. (2017). Inter-organizational marketing relationships. *Business Management Review*, 9(2), 65–80.
- Turban, E., King, D., Lee, J., Liang, T., & Turban, D. (2018). *Electronic commerce: A managerial and social networks perspective* (9th ed.). Springer.
- Uusitalo, O. (2009). Interactive media communication models. *Journal of Media Business Studies*, 6(3), 5–18.
- Wadhawan, N. (2016). Online advertising effectiveness. *International Journal of Marketing Research*, 58(4), 455–470.
- Yang, C., Chen, Y., & Wang, Y. (2011). Digital competence and communication attitudes. *Journal of Information Technology Education*, 10, 43–55.
- Yoon, S., & Kim, J. (2016). Online advertising efficiency in B2B marketing. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 54, 21–30.
- Za, S., & Tricahyadinata, I. (2017). Integrated marketing communications and digital strategies. *Journal of Marketing Communications*, 23(4), 379–395.