RESEARCH PAPER

Analyzing Fear of Terrorism in Pakistan: A Review

Dr. Waheed Ahmed Abbasi* 1 Dr. Sumera Irum 2Dr Ghulam Mujtaba Khushk3

1. Assistant Professor, Department of Criminology, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Faculty of Education, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan
3. Assistant Professor, Department of Rural Sociology, Sindh Agriculture University Tandojam, Sindh, Pakistan

PAPER INFO

ABSTRACT

Received: November 11, 2020
Accepted: March 01, 2021
Online: March 15, 2021

Terrorism disturbs social integration by creating fear for people of becoming victims of its harmful results. People who exposed to violent conditions and poor socioeconomic conditions relatively develop feelings of anxiety and frustration, and risk of becoming potential victims on social, physical and emotional grounds. After 9/11, with world, Pakistan has observed sporadic series of terrorism and violent extremist bouts which have been analyzed arising from disorderly conditions on political, social, religious and economic levels. Vulnerability of becoming victim of terrorism has equally developed which has deeply affected the emotional response of people to a greater extent. How people perceive the threat of terrorism has not been studied in the Pakistani context on theoretical and methodological levels. It is expected that understanding of this problem will provide better insights for people, policymakers and academicians to devise effective polices for creating chances of peace and healthy environment.

Keywords:
Fear,
Gender,
Social Media,
Terrorism,
Vulnerability

*Corresponding Author
w.abbasi@usindh.edu.pk

Introduction

Terrorism and extremism are deeply rooted in ideological orientation which can be related to sectarian or religious segregations and unequal socio-political conditions in the Pakistani context. The youth who are in the process of social and psychological development are largely and mainly influenced by the sectarian-based segregations, disadvantaged sociopolitical situations and weak social justice. Terrorism and extremism harm human life. No moral, religious and legal code allows one group to kill other. However, individual life and threat to the peace and social harmony have been at a greater risk as perceived or actual by the violent terrorist acts and the activities of religious extremist groups not only in Pakistan (Rasheed & Khalid, 2016) but around the world (Underhill, 2011; May et al., 2011; Cohen-Louck, 2016). Pakistan has observed multiple terrorist attacks including...
extremist clashes in universities, suicide bombings and terrorist attacks on schools and religious places (Rasheed and Khalid, 2016). According to some source there were 2,586 terrorist attacks in Pakistan with highest reported incidents as 1137 in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and lowest as 30 in Sindh and 12 in Islamabad in 2009 (Underhill, 2011: 109). Despite deployment of military and various operations to curb terrorism in Pakistan such as Al-Mizan in 2002 and Kalosha in 2004 (Khalid and Roy, 2016: 241-242), the overall levels of terrorism have been upward which include terrorist incidents within and without the borders of Pakistan (Underhill, 2011). Though Pakistani government has paid much attention to the internal security and tensions on borders but has neglected the social and psychological needs of its citizens to develop support against terrorism and violent extremism. This callousness and neglect has resulted in the development of distrust between masses, hatred between different religious sects and sense of fear of terrorism as overall across Pakistan (Underhill, 2011; Khalid and Roy, 2016). Internal insecurities and violence have not only created the feelings of terrorist victimization and criminal insecurity in population but also have proved to be detrimental to the economic development and cultural harmony within the population of Pakistan. It is undeniably believed that terrorist attacks remain constant threat to internal and external stability, and social, economic and psychological development of state and population (Khalid and Roy, 2016). Therefore, without examining how people develop their moral sense against insecurities like terrorism and religious extremism, we cannot devise better policies to counter those issues and subsequently leading to establish peaceful and coexistence environment.

The terrorism involves purposeful infliction of violence or force on the targeted population to create fear in order to gain desired goals including religious, psychological and political. Therefore, terrorism constitutes humans loss to physical, economic, psychological and emotional wellbeing of individuals (May et al, 2011). Terrorism is a method adopted by a wide range of ideologies for achievement of certain objectives like social, political and religious. Terrorism itself is not an ideology or social, political and religious orientation but it is calculated or adopted method to gain potential success for the desired goals (Schmid, 2011:1). However, how public react to such events of terrorism, as some scholars for example Ferraro (1995) believes that reaction of public to the crime of terrorism is subjective which varies from culture to culture and within different social strata. However, the act of terrorism is seen differently by different people, for example, the actors of terrorism may see it legitimate while victims of it see it illegitimate. Strangely, why certain people have favoring while some others have differing attitude about the same act should be examined. It is understood that crime and its panic affects not only physical being but also thinking patterns, like terrorism produces fear of becoming direct victim of it, consequently one can develop a hidden idea in their minds that what ‘will I be next?’ (Schmid, 2011: 2). The ‘next’ indicates the fear of dying or losing economic or social relations.
Analyzing Fear of Terrorism in Pakistan: A Review

Understanding of terrorism through examination of its effects on psyche of population and how people react to terrorist incidents is important for the state to formulate social and criminal policies as to provide physical and emotional security and safety to the wellbeing of its citizens. Terrorism is harmful homicidal act understood in criminology (Wollhuter et al., 2008). Criminology provides understanding of terrorism and its impacts on individuals’ social and psychological life. Literature including criminological, political science, sociological, and psychological is rich in examining terrorism and its social and psychological or emotional effects on individuals life and their attitudes (Ben-Zur et al., 2012; Mullins and Young, 2012; Eski, 2016). However, criminologists such as Rosenfeld, 2003 and LaFree (2007), and other scholars such as May et al. (2011) and Cohen-Louck (2016) strongly feel that understanding of terrorism through examination of fear and perceived risk of violent victimization has not been evaluated, and, most importantly, such understanding has not been developed in Pakistani context. This article therefore attempts to distinguish why certain people develop sense of fear against terrorism by critically reviewing the related Western literature and especially Pakistani to develop a better understanding about it in the Pakistan context.

Terrorism and Religious Violent Extremism in Pakistan

Terrorism has been incredibly dangerous to social and psychological safety of Pakistani people. People have suffered a lot because of the terrorist attacks. However, there is no systematic database providing how many incidents of exact causalities have been so far, several researchers such as Ahmed Majidyar (Majidyar, 2010), Habib (2013) and Johnston and Sarbahi, (2016) strongly believe that not having systematic structure of data on terrorist causalities and incidents provide less understanding about how and why terrorism emerges in the context of Sindh and Pakistan.

Pakistan faces serious problem of terrorism and extremism. According to the report prepared on national security in Pakistan, Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies (PIPS) reported that there were 1442 terrorist attacks including 60 suicide-bombing incidents in 2007 which caused death and injuries, and had traumatic effects on the life of population. In addition, there were 3448 human causalities during 2005 and 2006, which left people homeless, destitute and emotionally disturbed (Siddiqui et al, 2009: 441). After 9/11, Pakistan has been exposed to various terrorist violent threats and incidents. Social, economic and psychological wellbeing of people have been at high risks due to unending and sporadic wave of terrorist activities. For example, DAWN, a leading newspaper in its 16 April 2017 edition reposts that terrorist attack on the Army Public School in Peshwar killed 148 school-going children in December 2014. Other religious terrorist incident that caused fatal loss to human life took place in a religious place in the province of Sindh, which killed 70 innocent people including women and children and injured more than 150 devotees in the shrine of Lal ShahbazQalandarSehwan (DAWN, Feb 16, 2017). All these and many other terrorist incidents have caused physical and emotional loss, created a sense of losing life and creating fear of insecurity about places. Therefore, fear is often calculated as
‘public space phenomenon’ (Pain, 2000; 368), some scholars for instance Natasha Underhill believe that perceptions and feelings of people emerge due to relative experiences and observations of disorderly criminal conditions, levels of crime and breakdown of social arrangement in society (Underhill, 2011). In order to know how and why people develop the sense of fear against terrorism and violence, this article has certain objectives like to review the literature to learn how the fear of crime and terrorism has been discussed in the Western and Pakistani literature, to theoretically conceptualize the framework of understanding societal variables affecting fear of terrorism in Pakistan, and, to provide conclusion based on the developed understanding by surveying existing literature on the topic.

Methodological Approach and Conceptual Framework of Fear of Terrorism

Fear of crime has not been given much attention in the criminological literature, especially in the Pakistani context. However, in the Western literature, scholars have varying arguments about the sources and motivations of fear. This article aims to understand fear of terrorism by reviewing international and national literature to theoretically conclude associated causative factors of fear in Pakistan. Fear in a broad sense as understood by Smith (1987) can be understood as an emotional reaction to a physical harm and threat, it is an expressive feelings of danger developed as thought to be harmed by others. For example, due to recent events of target killing or suicide bombing (Arslan et al., 2014) or spread of Covid19 (Mamun&Ullah, 2020), many people avoid to attend religious and public places in Pakistan. Fear as perceived and experienced differently by different social and age groups is the out of the range of reactions to threatening and harmful conditions created by different criminal acts like robbery, ethnic conflicts, religious extremist encounters, violence against women and children, political violence, and terrorist incidents. As crime has no single causative factor likewise fear does not appear from a single criminal situation and is not equally experienced by all age, social and physical groups. Multiple people exposed to different criminal happenings react to fear unpredictably, for example, some people who live the communities which are not well protected with security gates feel threatened for robbing and stealing of their property and valuable items in Pakistan (Bint-e-Waheed& Nadeem, 2019). According to the quantitative research based on structured interviews (Bint-e-Waheed& Nadeem, 2019), the residents of the communities which are not safeguarded properly experience more activities of crime as compare to those well protected. However, due to the increased levels and frequent incidents of crime of theft, robbery and trespassing, the former group possesses increased levels of fear. Experiences and perceptions of fear vary from one social group to other; likewise different ethnic groups react to it differently. For example, ethnic-based violence created due to diversity of multiple languages, has been continuous problem observed by the people of Karachi city of Pakistan while people of each ethnic group has continuous fear against each other (Amin & Ahmad, 2018). As perceptions of criminal violence vary in different communities and ethnic groups, similarly, sensitivity to violent crime varies in different gender groups, for example, in a
quantitative study the reactions of fear about sexual, emotional and physical harassment were measured and found female had higher levels of fear against those violent events as compare to males (Mansoor& Hasan, 2016). The more one is exposed to violent and dangerous incidents on personal and social levels, the more one develops the sense of sensitivity to risk model; that means, as analyzed by some scholars (e.g., Shechory&Silawi, 2019), the severity of violent crime explains the likelihood of criminal victimization. As much as people are exposed to physical threatening prospects that much people erect the levels of sensitivity of fear of being victimized. All these different types of crimes explain people develop their sense or sensitivity of fear out of multiple experiences and observations in their communities, ethnic-based structure and gendered ideological framework. It can safely be said, therefore, peaceful environment can provide healthy chances for people to live peaceably which can prove to be positive contribution to the social, economic and political development of society. However, it requires further more understanding what impacts people to develop levels of sense of fear in their life in Pakistan.

Victimization approach and Fear of Crime of Terrorism

The understanding of the fear of crime has been developed from a dominant perspective of victimology, a strong theoretical approach in criminology (Walklate, 2012). The perspective of victimology emerged during 1960s and became dominant researching area to understand why certain people based on gender and social class become victims of crime and violence, and how they develop sense of victimization (Zarafonitou and Tseloni, 2008). According to this perspective, experiences of victimization cause increase the fear of being victims of crimes and vulnerable to criminal conditions. Some research measured the impact of victimization on fear by gauging the 'person risk assessment'. According to such research, it was calculated that people belonging to certain areas where they experienced situations of criminal victimizations relatively extended feelings of fear of being victims, and some women as compare to men, and orderly people, have more fear of being sexually assaulted and violently killed respectively (Andersen & Mayerl, 2018). Much research has been conducted in this regard of studying fear of crime and terrorism. Some research scholars investigated impact of events of terrorism on fear on population (Huddy et al. 2002; Ahmed 2015), some studied media and its impact on fear (Nellis and Savage 2012; Abbasi et al., 2020), the bulk of the literature attempt to conceptualize the fear of terrorism in the Western context. However, very limited number of studies has been conducted to look into how theoretically fear of terrorism is influenced by societal variables in the Pakistani context. This article looks into the problem of fear of terrorism with focus on development of framework of societal variables impacting fear of terrorism in Pakistan. Victimization of has been understood on various patterns, people marginalized on geographical, social status and gender levels relatively develop the sensitivity of fear towards crime and terrorism.
Impact of social media and experiences of victimization

Terrorism, terrorist attacks and perceived or actual fear of the victimization are growing areas of interest for criminological research globally recently. Actually the fear of terrorism has reduced to much extent because of the taken counter measures against terrorism across the globe and especially in Pakistan which is 5th in rank of terrorism index in 2018 (Sarwar, et al., 2020). The people who live in the countries or places where incidents of terrorism and violent extremism take place develop feelings of fear of being killed or injured or victimized by direct or indirect acts of terrorism and violence (Nellis & Savage, 2012). Being exposed to terrorist experience, knowledge and information also create sensitivity towards terrorism and violence. How fear is created or perceived by people should be understood, for example, the people of Paris and Brussels who had not observed the incidents of terrorist attacks had no fear that such peaceful places could be attacked (Estrada & Koutronas, 2016). Correspondingly in Pakistan, religious and educational places were thought to be peaceful and away from such criminal attacks, but terrorist attack on Army Public School (APS) killed 150 lives of students in Peshawar, and in Nigeria 276 schoolgirls were abducted which left people having sensitivity of risk that schools and peaceful areas can be target of terrorism and violence (Malik et al., 2018; Sarwar, et al., 2020). Likewise, religions have been assumed as source of fear by many countries or people around the world. Though many empirical research studies find that there is no relationship between Islam like other religions and terrorism, but after 11 September, the day of terrorist attacks on Twin Towers in Oklahoma City, the Europeans have increasingly and seriously been looking down upon Muslims and Islam as being terrorist and disturbing socio-political environment around the world (Gleditsch and Rudolfsen 2016; Sarwar, et al., 2020).

This approach further explains that media news, communication and perceived susceptibility can help increase the fear levels of individuals. In recent years, social media has been a dominant platform and influential source of changing patterns of emotions, behaviour and thinking process of people. On one side, social media including newspapers, Television, Facebook, WhatsApp, and YouTube have created increased awareness about social issues for social masses, on the other side, it has created public fear and anxiety about violence and terrorism. Some scholars believe media coverage and reporting result in distortion of images among elderly population settled in rural areas (Victor, 2006). Though, according to a study conducted in Pakistan by Abbasi and his colleagues (Abbasi, et al., 2020), social media is perceived as negatively influencing the mind of youth people leading to develop antisocial intentions of harming others, but many of them excessively use different technological platforms of social media. Their study reveals that the youth who use social media excessively and become exposed to a variety of content available there develop criminal intentions (Abbasi, et al., 2020). The media may be crucial in shaping human behaviours and reactions to terrorism, and perceptions about fear and risks of terrorism and violence. The role of the electronic television channels is very important in increasing or decreasing fear of terrorism and terrorist attacks.
Some scholars, for example, May and his colleagues, believe that the 9/11 incidents have shaped the media reporting of terrorism and its link to fear production and perceived terrorist risk (May et al., 2011). The media dramatically reframed reporting mechanisms because of extraordinary emergencies caused by terror attacks. The media have greatly impacted how people perceive terrorists, respond during attacks and live with fear and trauma of possible attacks (Borgeson and Valeri, 2009). Some studies found that Americans were not having the fear before the incidents of 9/11 as much they have developed after the incident (Victor, 2006). It was however assessed that portrayal of terrorist attacks caused much increase in fear of terrorism and victimization among citizens. The way the media covers incidents of terror may cause development of fear and anxiety among people as some scholars like DiMaggio (2008), Underhill (2011), and May et al. (2011) argue individuals’ psychological framework and cognitive perspective become developed by observing and analyzing outer world and its activities.

The above literature indicate that creation and development of fear of terrorist attacks and risk of personal violent victimization may be influenced by a variety of reasons, about which criminology has not still developed fuller sense of understanding. Undeniably believed that media exposure affects mental process and reactions of affected people negatively instilling sense of vulnerability (DiMaggio 2008; May et al., 2011); however, those vulnerable and marginalized communities have negative feelings about their own social status and about the policies of their government. Consequently, the perception about the government as being weak, corrupt and non-cooperative in the eyes of public becomes a continuous source of doubt and suspicion for them (Josiger, 2009). Fear of terrorism which is accelerated or advertised by media, however, is differently perceived by different social groups in society. For example, young people who use social media continuously become neutralized and insensitive to the contents on the social media, therefore, relatively do not have fear of being victimized (Abbasi, et al., 2020). Rather they become criminally influenced for having criminal attitudes to harm others in Pakistan (Abbasi, et al., 2020).

Social Space, Social Status and Cultural Thinking Patterns

Understanding of fear of crime and terrorism has been associated with characteristics of socio-demographic experiences and conditions, though there is no consensus on what features of social groups predominantly become vulnerable to the feelings of terrorism. But is established understanding that due to past experiences, lived experiences and exposure to violence, people develop different levels of sensitivity to fear, risk and perceptions about crime and victimization (Warr, 1987; Abbasi, 2016). Much research has been carried out, for instance in some research, it was found that those exposed to experiences of the events of terrorism and violence in urban areas relatively have greater fear of becoming victimized (Abbasi, 2016) and the women who did not even become victims of violence had higher levels of fear of victimization (Wilcox & Ozer, 2009). Events of terrorism in America changed the thinking patterns of its residents. For example, it has been
analyzed that Americans still fear that any other attack of 9/11 type can be coming at any time although it is contrary to any reality (Cohen-Louck, 2011). This means fear of perceived attack remains active among victim population (Nellis, 2007 and Friedman, 2005). The reports of Americans (47.7 per cent) say that many citizens are very much concerned about future serious attack on them. The elderly less educated people and women are found to be more fearful about criminal elements and have insecure feelings from possible terrorist attacks (Boscarino et al., 2003). Some other scholars for example Boscarino et al. (2003), conducted research on fear of terrorism and found that 42 per cent of the common citizens were very worried even after 9/11 attacks in an American city, Oklahoma. Other studies found social status as significant factor in developing perceptions of fear of crime and violence. It was found that individuals with lower incomes were expressing more concern and worry for possible terrorist attacks (Moore, 1999). Americans have predicted fear of robbery, dacoity and rape so they have same worrying concern about terrorism. Some studies go on further revealing that gender, income status and living areas are some of the strong predictors of creating fear of terrorism. Women, youth, elderly and low-income population groups are more likely to be having increased actual and perceived fear of terrorism and terrorist attacks (Fisher & Sloan, 2003; Killias&Clerici, 2000).

The demography, gender and social status are some of the factors of importance if terrorist-victimization and perceived fear of terrorist attacks are to be measured. The perceptions of different locations including urban and rural vary in their nature so the levels and perceptions about fear and anxiety about terrorism and violent extremism vary. It is due to different experiences of exposure to violence or victimization caused by violent attacks which may be directly or indirect related to acts of terrorism (May et al., 2011). However, levels of fear and experiences explain the sense of fear of insecure criminal conditions within the environment the people are living. Theoretically, the fear has been studied from various approaches, for example, the risk interpretation approach explains that levels of fear can be produced by various factors including background experiences of individuals and nature of social conditions which can ensure the possibilities of victimization and losing some loved ones. This fear, as understood from this approach, demonstrates that sense of victimization can be related to different types, for instance, of material, job related, loss of self and family members, and disorderly conditions within neighborhood (Wilcox & Ozer, 2009).

The people who are sensitive to outer-world phenomenon their thinking patterns become shaped and influenced by the unwanted and dangerous conditions prevalent in society, though, there is no consistency on what actual variables can be called as dominant for changing their discerning outlines (Forst, 2007; Huddy et al., 2002; Wilcox & Ozer, 2009). Some scholars found those believe terrorists are religiously greedy, disordered, and flawed personality; possess relatively higher levels of fear against terrorists and terrorism (Sjoberg, 2005). Growing research has established a significant relationship of viewing violent contents on television with
acquiring violent and sexual behaviour and of certain dangerous material on
YouTube with developing fear (Houston, 2009), and of impact of fear of terrorism
with job attitude (Malik & Kiyani, 2017). A range of literature based on review of
secondary literature indicates that coverage of terrorism on TV and other platforms
cause posttraumatic fear of people resulting in development of self-alienation and
mental illness. Content available on social media has been found affecting and
shaping individuals' schemas and personal orientation. Therefore, event of terrorism
and violence help people form fear and anxiety against it (Houston, 2009). In
Pakistan, a study was conducted by Malik & Kiyani (2017) to explore the impact of
fear of terrorism on job attitude. In their quantitative study, they documented that
fear of terrorism has a harmful impact on the way the respondents performed their
jobs, since their respondents watched continuously the news of terrorism on TV so
they settled the fearful of losing their jobs, getting low salary and becoming fearful
of being and their family members killed (Malik & Kiyani, 2017).

Conclusion

The overview of the fear of terrorism explains that understanding of fear of
terrorism and violent crimes has not been developed in criminological literature in
the Pakistani context due to limited body of empirical research. What impacts the
fear of terrorism has been seen from a variety of theoretical and methodological
approaches, but the bulk of Western and very limited Pakistani literature have failed
to provide theoretical framework of fear of terrorism. Fear is a broader umbrella
term can be associated resulting from a variety of social and criminal conditions,
however, people having experiences of social exclusion, physical victimization and
insecure conditions develop comparatively higher levels of fear of being harmed.
The expressive and responsive feelings of fear can be shaped by one’s levels of
observations and experiences of terrorist attacks and risks or real physical
victimizations. As terrorism aims to succeed in instilling its fear among people for
gaining political, psychological and social benefits; it really does. After 9/11, with
world, Pakistan has observed sporadic series of terrorism and violent extremist
bouts which have been associated with disorderly conditions on social, religious and
economic levels. One way to know that terrorism has created fear that people feel
risk of becoming its victims on physical, psychological and social grounds. Other
way to examine it how fear of terrorism becomes maximized or enhanced by societal
variables around the people they live.

Scholarship has paid much attention to this issue, the victimology, a
dominant perspective in criminology, has provided serious understanding what
societal elements impact people to become emotional and expressive of risk of
threatening conditions. The people who feel vulnerable to social and criminal
conditions relatively and comparatively have higher levels of being harassed and
physically harmed leading to injuring and killing. However, the vulnerability of
victimization can be expressed and established by social media. The sensitivity and
portrayal of terrorist incidents and losses of humans in such incidents are widely
watched and listened to by a huge public. This creates a fear for them that they can
be victims of such harmful events, they can be killed or their loved ones can be killed. The overage of such threatening news on social media impacts emotional reaction and thinking patterns of people which can result in development of anxiety, self-isolation and psychological abnormalities. Spread of the news and information as believed instills the likelihood of perceived susceptibility to become victims of any of such criminal act. Some scholars believe that the people who suffer from economic frustrations and belong to elderly age group relatively extend higher levels of fear of becoming victims of the crimes taking place within their communities and terrorist acts.

The socio-demographic characteristics having insecure borders and criminally violent conditions existing within communities become high source of anxiety and frustration for people. It is observed that people from rural and urban areas have different fears; for example, rural areas may be fearful of being robbed of their valuable items while urban who experience threats of ethnic and religious violence may feel physically assaulted and killed in an unpredictable act of terrorism. In addition, urban people may sense their income and financial conditions can be affected due to happening of criminal and terrorist acts in their localities. Urban people apart from crimes of violence taking place within their communities, they are also fearful of violent encounter of their ethnic counterparts; the severity of criminal and violent situations will ensure the likelihood of criminal victimization and loss of their life. However, on gender-based the perceptions and feelings of fear vary. Women have relatively higher levels of fear, while those living in poorly safeguarded areas have higher levels of fear and those exposed to seriously violent nature of physical environment have higher levels of fear that they will be deprived of their physical being, economic status and loss of their loved ones. All these different types of crimes, social conditions and personal experiences determine the levels of sense or sensitivity of fear crime and terrorism in Pakistan.
References


