



RESEARCH PAPER

**Punjab Govt. Policy to Recruit Female Teachers in Boys' Schools:
Prospects, Problems and Challenges**

Dr. Fayyaz Ahmad Ranjha ¹ Dr. Shakeela Shah ² Sonia Iram ³

1. Education Officer, School Education Department, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Department of Curriculum Development & Instructions, Faculty of Education, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan
3. Ph. D Scholar, Department of Education, University of Education, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

PAPER INFO

Received:
September 03, 2018
Accepted:
December 24, 2018
Online:
December 30, 2018

Keywords:

Challenges,
Female Teachers,
Problems,
Prospects,
Recruitment Policy

**Corresponding
Author**

fiazahmad73@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

This study has been conducted to find out whether female teachers have to face problems while working in Boys Public Schools in the presence of male colleagues and prospects of male staff about their female counterparts in the province Punjab. A questionnaire was developed by the researcher to find out female teachers' prospects, problems and challenges while working in Boys Public Schools, interviews were also conducted by the researcher from male and female teachers working in Boys Public Schools. Data were collected from 84 Boys Public Schools from two districts Lahore and Okara by using convenient sampling technique. 183 female teachers and 200 male teachers (EST, SESE, ESE and PST) participated in this study. Mean, chi square and Cramer's V were measured. Findings indicated that there were no significant difference in the views' of female teachers of urban/rural and (EST, SESE, ESE and PST) teachers. Female teachers were satisfied in Boys Public School except the issue of single staff room and free amalgamation of both genders reported by some of them. Responses from male teachers showed that they were satisfied by this recruitment policy. On the other hand some did not seem to be in the favor of this recruitment policy because they considered it as gender biasness.

Introduction

Teacher recruitment policy of the Government of Punjab 2013 allowed the appointment of female teachers in both primary and middle Boys Public Schools as well as Consolidated Model Primary Schools. A lot of female teachers are working in primary and elementary Boys Public Schools and high schools as well in Punjab. Pakistani society predominantly observes Islamic values which do not allow and

appreciate free amalgamation and interaction of female and male. Most of the girls particularly in rural areas as well as in urban areas observe parda and wear veil. Girls do opt to be appointed in Boys Public Schools for want of employment whether they are comfortable in Boys Public Schools and can they perform their duties without any restriction and hesitation, are the question to be researched.

A large number of female staff has been recruited in male schools, where the head of the schools are male, majority of the teachers and all of the students are male. In this situation, it's difficult for female staff to move freely and to perform their teaching practices according to their full potential.

Literature Review

Recruitment is the action of appointing new people in the rest. It is a process to find and hire the best qualified candidates (from inside or outside the organization) in a cost effective manner in an organization. The recruitment process includes analysis of job requirements, to attract employees to work, screening and selection of candidates, the hiring and integration of new employees to the organization (WebFinance, Inc., 2015).

Sourcing of new employees in the recruitment process is undertaken specific model of how an organization hires employees. Again this may vary depending on the specific organizational structure; ownership of the recruitment process in general, remains within the Human Resources function. A recruitment process can be broken down in the relevant sections. Exact name and condition of the process steps are unique to an organization, a typical recruitment process is a vacancy, a job description at this time of preparation, sourcing database, the marketing, response management, short-listing, interviews, reference checks could start with the identification and selection (Kelly Services Inc., 2015).

A research by Daoust, G.D. et al. (2013) examined that inequalities in teaching profession can also exist due to the unequal distribution of teaching responsibilities in primary schools. In primary schools female teachers are often responsible for lower classes and male teachers considered responsible for higher level of classes. As cited by Daoust, G.D. that teachers' perceptions regarding personality and character can influence their management approaches, just like their class activities. For instance a national-level NGO representative explained that females are certainly more suitable to workout with younger children, on the other hand males often face some tricky situations while working with young children. The reason behind this situation is that younger children require intensive attention towards them which is not naturally provided by males (Gabrielle D. Daoust, 2013). Female teachers are naturally very emotional and become personal within no time which influences the moral of the school (Smith, 2003). In line with these findings it was found that Punjab Government took an initiative to give opportunity to female teachers apply in both boys and girls schools. After this policy announcement (2013) a huge amount of female

candidates applied in the boys public schools both in the primary and middle as well as Consolidated Model Primary Schools. It allowed the females to avail both opportunities in boys and girls schools. On the other hand male candidates just applied in the boys public schools.

Epstein (1988) and other researchers as cited by Lee, V.E. revealed that coeducational schools in United States are norms of the society because these schools publicize that they are serving for the needs of both genders. However previous research has pointed out that coeducational schools may be socializing students into gender-biased roles. Lee, V.E. in his study found that female teachers in coeducational schools see themselves less power to participate in school policy than that of their male colleagues (Lee, Loeb, & Marks, 1995).

Another study by Acker (1983) as cited by Lee, V.E. indicate that female teachers do not opt to participate and compete for the position of power because they have many other duties regarding their family and house chores. Women don't perceive them as confident to lead the school organizational factors and control over school policies, as men perceived more dominant. But it's not true to say that women do not perform these tasks. In girls' schools they have to perform all of these duties. It shows that some of the characteristics of girls' school that lead women to perform all duties and make them feel empowered (Lee, Loeb, & Marks, 1995). A report by Commonwealth Secretariat & UNESCO (2011) examined that in a number of countries men don't like to maintain their position at primary level of teaching because of its low status and income and uncertain opportunities for career advancement (UNESCO, 2011).

From the last two spans teaching profession has become a feminized occupation with two third number of female teachers in primary and secondary schools in Australia. In addition data from England and America showed a great number of female teachers entry in education profession. Over the last ten years there has been a large decrease in the number of male primary and secondary school teachers. Entry of male in pre-service teacher training courses also has a decrease due to its wide range towards feminization and some students at primary level not even encounter single male teacher during their primary level of education. This ratio of male pre-service and in-service teacher is same in the US and Europe (Acquaro, 2012).

As cited by Daniela, A. (2012) Hartman (1999) that feminization of teaching may be seen as a profitable and valuable aspect for our society. At the same time it is seen as a problematic issue for the education of boys. One of the view is that feminization of education at early stages is effecting on the achievement of boys' negatively in academic and social areas. Daniela, A. also cited West (1999) that feminization of schools and lack of male teachers in school education create a problem in maintaining school discipline, educational outcomes and making education interesting for boys (Acquaro, 2012).

Gender roles and gender dynamics are formed by social and cultural beliefs and expectations of a society. These gendered perceptions are base for traditional role of female teachers as well as male teachers in a society and also influence on their gender based violence in school as well as in community. A study in Cameroon exposed a report by Male sub-divisional inspector that female teachers have to experience some harassment by male teachers and managers. These type of issues impact on teachers' psychological and professional status which become reason to leave their positions (Gabrielle, 2013).

As cited by Caldarella, P. et al. Little (2005) reports that 66% of the boys' students create disturbance in classroom situation the ratio is two boys on a girl. The findings of this study is based on cross cultural study of Turkish and English classroom which is observed and resulted that boys in Turkish classrooms are required twice managerial instructions over girls and four times in English classrooms (Caldarella, Shatzer, & Michael, 2009). Female teachers have to face more problems by boys' disruptive behaviour due to their gender discrimination. The presence of male teachers not only makes difference in environment of class but also have an awkward influence in the setting of staffroom activities (Asthana, 2009).

A study by INTO has been conducted on the sharp decline of male competitors in primary teaching. The issue has been come to see all around the developed countries, there is a need to avoid this type of gender imbalance into the workplace conditions. The participation of both genders at primary level is inevitable for the provision of role models of both sexes, and creating a balanced work environment conditions. It also argued if this trend will continue, men will disappear from primary setup of education system before the mid of this century (INTO, 2004).

Material and Methods

The study adopted a mixed method research approach by integrating both qualitative and quantitative techniques for data collection and analysis. For this purpose 84 Boys Public Schools were randomly selected. 183 Female teachers and 200 male teachers were randomly selected as the sample of the study.

Instrumentation

Three instruments Focus group discussion, questionnaire and semi-structured interview were developed by the researcher to collect quantitative and qualitative data. Focus group discussions were conducted by the researchers to collect the views of female teachers on their prospective problems. It was basically conducted to collect information regarding their challenges on which basis the questionnaire was developed. The five point likert scale questionnaire was used to assess the female teachers' experiences. Semi structured interviews from female and male teachers were also conducted by the researchers.

Conceptual framework of Instrument

Instrument was designed by the researcher on the base of thoroughly reviewed literature and a number of schools were also visited by the researcher personally to find out the problems and challenges faced by female teachers in Boys Public Schools by conducting a few focus group discussions (FGDs).

Pilot Testing

After finalizing the research instrument, it was pilot tested by administering to 31 female teachers from Boys Public Schools. After administering, reliability of this instrument was analyzed by Cronbach's Alpha. The reliability of female teachers' views on prospects, problems and challenges statements was 0.762. After this, 20 statements were finalized for data collection process.

Results and Discussion

Table 1

Views of female Teachers	Percentage responses					MRV
	S A	A	U	D	S D	
Male students are satisfied with my teaching	37.7	52.5	7.1	0.5	1.6	4.25
Female teachers are satisfied with male head behavior	39.3	51.4	4.4	3.3	1.6	4.23
Male staff respect female staff	31.1	60.7	3.8	3.3	0.5	4.19
Female teachers satisfied working in boys' school	27.9	56.3	6.6	7.7	1.1	4.03
Female teachers' have no problem on combine staffroom	2.2	16.4	8.7	42.1	30.6	2.17

Table of mean value of female teachers' responses revealed that male students were satisfied by their teaching, have no issue regarding male staff and they were satisfied working in boys' schools as mean value of the statements were above the point of agree $3.5 \leq \text{MRV} < 4.5$. Their views on combine staff room showed that they were not in the favor of combine staffroom $1.5 \leq \text{MRV} < 2.5$.

Table 2

Summary of Chi square and Cramer's V for association between female teachers' views and location

Views of female teachers	Locale	N	Percentage (%) Responses					χ^2	Sig.	C.V
			S A	A	U	D	S D			
Female teachers satisfied with male head behavior	U	105	34.3	51.4	5.7	5.7	2.9	9.3	.05	.225
	R	78	46.2	51.3	2.6	0.0	0.0			
Male and female have equal workload	U	105	21.9	41.9	9.5	22.	3.8	11.5	.02	.250
	R	78	25.6	55.1	3.8	7.7	7.7			
Females have no problem	U	105	16.2	57.1	6.7	17.	2.9	12.4	.02	.260

work with male colleague	R	78	33.3	44.9	11.5	6.4	3.8			
No problem in teaching male students'	U	105	19	54.3	7.6	12.	6.7	13.3	.01	.269
	R	78	35.9	43.6	12.8	7.7	0			
Students' hesitate to communicate with female	U	105	2.9	13.3	7.6	58.	18.1	12.6	.01	.263
	R	77	3.9	20.8	22.1	44.	9.1			

The summary of chi square between female teachers' views and their location on the above given statements showed that female teachers of urban areas have some of the problems regarding these factors. While one of the issue male students hesitate to communicate with female teachers found in rural areas. Cramer's V value for these statements revealed that there is a weak association between the views of urban and rural female teachers.

Table 3

Views of female teachers	Designation	N	Percentage (%) Responses					χ^2	Sig.	C.V
			S A	A	U	D	S D			
Male staff respect female staff	PST	107	25.2	71	1.9	1.9	0	46.02	.00	.290
	ESE	56	37.5	46.4	8.9	7.1	0			
	SESE	11	72.7	27.3	0	0	0			
	EST	8	12.5	75	0	0	12.5			
Equal opportunity to perform managerial tasks	PST	108	19.4	57.4	6.5	15.7	0.9	32.9	.00	.246
	ESE	56	29.1	47.3	14.5	9.1	0			
	SESE	11	18.2	45.5	18.2	9.1	9.1			
	EST	8	12.5	62.5	0	0	25			
Female teachers have problem due to male students	PST	107	1.9	27.1	17.8	44.9	8.4	21.1	.04	.197
	ESE	56	0	32.1	5.4	41.1	21.4			
	SESE	11	9.1	27.3	18.2	18.2	27.3			
	EST	8	0	50	0	50	0			
Male students satisfied by my teaching	PST	107	37.4	56.1	6.5	0	0	21.7	.04	.199
	ESE	56	39.3	48.2	7.1	1.8	3.6			
	SESE	11	63.6	36.4	0	0	0			
	EST	8	0	62.5	25	0	12.5			

Summary of Chi square and Cramer's v for association between female teachers' views and designation

The summary of chi square test revealed that χ^2 was significantly associated between female teachers' views and their designation on the above given statements. Most of the EST and ESE female teachers expressed that male staff did not respect female staff while the PST and SESE revealed that their male staff respect them and did not disgrace them in any matter at school. Mostly PST, ESE and EST's said that they had equal opportunities to perform managerial tasks in boys' public schools as compare to SESE's. With compare to other female teachers most of the EST female teachers' have to face problems due to the attitude of male students. ESE and SESE female teachers have almost same views on this issue. Most of the SESE female teachers said that male students were satisfied by their teaching as compare to PST, ESE and EST's. Hence some of the EST female teachers said that male students were not satisfied by their teaching. Cramer's V

value for these statements revealed that there is a weak association between the views of PST, ESE, SESE and EST female teachers.

Findings and Discussion

Most of the responses of female teachers' are positive but there is found some problems regarding their adjustment in boys' schools, availability of combine staffroom, attitude of male students, problem to maintain discipline in male students' class. According to female teachers with respect to their locale, some of the urban teachers have to face problem due to the attitude of male headmaster's behaviour and equal workload. Some of the urban teachers relatively has to face problem while working with male colleagues as compare to rural teachers. Sometime female teachers have to face problems in teaching male students' and students hesitate to communicate with them.

According to female teachers' categories, they have similar responses. Hence some of the EST's has to face problems regarding "Male colleagues respect female teachers" and "Equal opportunity to perform managerial tasks" as compare to PST, ESE and SESE. Some of the EST's has to face problems due to the attitude of male students as compare to other teachers. A few of the EST's have to face problems regarding "Male students satisfied by my teaching" as compare to PST, ESE and SESE.

Findings of female teachers Interviews

Majority of the female teachers in their interviews said that they have to face problem while working with male colleagues. It is difficult for single female teacher to work comfortably in boys' schools. Most of the female teachers expressed that it is difficult to handle boys' students after the age of 10. Availability of staffroom is a great challenge for female teachers in boys' schools. They expressed that they did not have separate staffroom in boys' schools.

Findings of male teachers Interviews

Male teachers expressed that it is a good step of the Govt. of Punjab but some of them negotiated that they are neglecting through this policy. Male teachers' views reflect that they are satisfied by this recruitment policy. They also suggested that Govt. should recruit at least two female teachers at one Boys Public School.

Conclusion

By considering the results of both quantitative and qualitative data it was concluded that female teachers do not have problems while working in Boys Public Schools. As female teachers expressed by their responses that cooperation of

male colleagues prove helpful for them. Female teachers are satisfied by working with male colleagues.

In Punjab female teachers are not suppressed by their male counterparts and managers, as such type of issue has not been found during this research study. Females are satisfied by their male head behavior and attitude of male colleagues. Females in boys' schools feel secure to work with male colleagues. It is also observed that female teachers do not have to face problems while controlling male students during class. Staffroom is the basic need of teachers. As more than half of the female teachers do not have staffroom availability in their schools and this issue is common in primary schools. Male and female teachers have equal opportunities to perform managerial tasks in boys' schools as following study has found.

Hence one of the issues of combine staffroom for male and female staff which is not yet practical in Boys Public Schools but only supposed to be applied in boys' schools has been responded negatively by female teachers. As studies suggest both genders do not feel comfortable at one place. It is the limitation of our religion the free amalgamation of male and females under the same roof without any relation. Females won't feel comfortable as it is also the limitation of our society.

Maintaining discipline in classrooms is a big deal for female teachers in boys' schools but following study has concluded that female teachers do not have problems while controlling male students and maintaining discipline in class. Hence it is a problem at elementary and secondary level which was reported by female teachers in interviews.

Qualitative data of the research show that both male and female teachers' views reflect that this recruitment policy is proved successful at primary level, hence creates some disturbance at elementary and high level to control male students of high classes by female teachers. Thus female teachers appreciate this recruitment policy and most of them are in its favor. Most of the head and male teachers of boys' schools has expressed that they are satisfied with their female colleagues.

According to them, it is a positive step of Govt. to minimize the communication gap between both genders at early level of education but some of the male staff are in the view of that this is not according to the values of our religion to accept this type of activities.

Recommendations

- 1) There should not be a single female teacher in Boys Public Schools.
- 2) Females must be provided with separate staffrooms in Boys Public Schools.

- 3) Male teachers are neglecting through this recruitment policy, so Govt. should take some action in this regard.
- 4) In future, students should also be involved while conducting such type of research.
- 5) The research will be more useful if only conducted qualitatively.

References

- Acquaro, D. (2012). *Despite All Odds: Female Teachers In Boys' Schools. The Need for Educational Research to Champion Freedom, Education and Development for All.* Melbourne: European Educational Research Association.
- Asthana, A. (2009, 7 12). *the guardian*. Retrieved from Guardian News and Media Limited or its affiliated companies.: <http://www.theguardian.com/education/2009/jul/12/primary-schools-male-teachers>
- Caldarella, P., Shatzer, R. H., & Michael J. Richardson. (2009). The impact of gender on Chinese elementary school teachers. *New Horizons in Education*, 18-19.
- Fagot, B. (1981). Male and female teachers: Do they treat boys and girls differently? *Sex Roles*, 263-271.
- Gabrielle D. Daoust, M. C. (2013). *Actions and interactions: Gender equality in teaching and education management in Cameroon.* Cameroon: VSO Bahaginan.
- INTO. (2004). *Gender Imbalance in Primary Teaching.* Ireland: An INTO Publication.
- Kazi Enamul Hoque, A. Z. (2013). Impact of Teacher-Gender on Primary Students' Achievement: A Study at Malaysian Standpoint. *Journal of Sociological Research*, 126-127.
- Kelly Services Inc. (2015). *KELLYOCG.* http://www.kellyocg.com/Solutions/Recruitment_Process_Outsourcing/What_is_a_Recruitment_Process/#.VjShHNx97IV
- Lee, V. E., Loeb, S., & Marks, H. M. (1995). Gender differences in Secondary school teachers' control over classroom and school policy. *American Journal of Education*, 259-301.
- Smith, S. (2003). *Teaching and the gender imbalance: do we need more MATES?* Bundaberg: Central Queensland University; Education Queensland; the Catholic Education Commission.
- UNESCO, C. S. (2011). *Women and the Teaching Profession: Exploring the feminisation debate.* London & Paris: Commonwealth Secretariat & UNESCO.
- WebFinance, Inc. (2015). *Business Dictionary.com.* Retrieved from Business Dictionary.com:<http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/recruitment.html>